

Post-truth Politics Media Debates in Communication

Muhammad Mashhood*

PhD Scholar, Department of Journalism & Mass Communication, University of Peshawar

Abstract:

This article makes the readers able to understand the “post-truth phenomena”, it is used in media debates as a strategy internationally and nationally. The study discussed in detail post-truth history, its types, continuation of post-truth, disobedient views of post-truth, uses of post truth and studied post-truth in literature review. Pakistan as a case study was analysed with the global context and concluded. The use of post-truth phenomena in media as strategy during political campaign on any issue. The study answers that the elite of political parties and media using the post-truth phenomena as campaign strategy during the political campaign or election campaign. Political leaders and media influencing their message on others in a limited time to change their selective choice. The library reading methodological approach and theory of elite power were used to analyse the reading stuff and found the exist method of politics as post-truth in indigenous terms were found in Pashtu Language as “Dozmar” and “Bongi” in Urdu and Panjabi. These types of statements producing the messenger intentionally to keep audience busy, happy, and emotional with himself.

Key words: post-truth, propaganda, politics, Media debates, political campaign & communication.

Introduction

Post-truth politics globally conceptualised phenomena that political leaders on media, public gathering, talk shows and manifesto committing promise on the basis of ideological perception, which taking serious political workers. The updated conceptual ideological half-truth statement which the leaders know that they will never complete this commitment, while promising the post-truth emotions base promises for future to convince maximum voters to win the elections and extend their political worker strength. Political leader

Post-truth an updated structure lies and half-truth statement producing by media and political elites on a specific time to change the people perception as sympathy, to change the vote choice of people in the election campaign. Post-truth is a fraud, media manipulation technique in political culture in which the debate is largely framed by media experts deliberately. Post-truth is fraud, media manipulation is also called post-factual politics, it appeals to the emotions to disconnect the detailed policy by the repeated assertion to ignore the accurate content of the political party. Post-truth is a latest manifestation of history misfortune in the relation of truth, power and politics, politicians selectively choosing and construct their facts in order to serve at the specific campaign strategy. Political ecologist academician and research challenging it as “alternative” that dominant, ruling party and elite using the new technique to control the public and sustain their power.

In Pakistan politics previously propaganda was found in a large-scale Pakistan politicians propagated Pakistan religious, ethnicity, sectarianism, development, democracy, dictatorship, while after the trump post-truth PM Imran Khan used post-truth phenomena in a structural way deliberately, emotionally, culturally, religiously, and produced post-truth statement and selected every group and individual demands discussed and promised. PTI leadership delivered 126 days post-truth speeches on the container which are called, “*Container Speeches*” during this time politicians used vulgar language against the parliament wish to destroy it, burnt the electricity bills, refuse to pay tax, threaten police, PTV and committed himself loyal to the public of Pakistan. In the current position Pakistan facing to economic, inflation, jobs and education problems.

Theory and Method:

Theoretical approach of the C. Wright Mills “*The Power Elite*” afterword by Alan Wolf in 1998 was used and found that political leader making post-truth messages deliberately to present himself efficient and other insufficient (Mills, 1998). The methodology of this study is qualitative in nature text reading analysis of (Caulfield, 2019) with the political cultural and media studies. Post-truth article in general and selective political party manifesto and its leader statements particularly and his approach with the spec of post-truth political method.

Definition:

- Post-truth is a conceptualized statement on the base of emotional and personal belief, polarizing media habits.
- Post-truth is a committed objective word, the word or statement which proved by historically and practically untruth.

Literature Review:

Post-truth is a connected objective facts while as “Word” post-truth resulted by google in 0.70 second about 913,000,000 results. It is defined by popular dictionaries “related to or signified circumstances in which objective facts are less influential in shaping public opinion than appeals to emotion and personal belief” After a huge discussion, debate, research post-truth considered by Oxford Dictionaries “word of the year 2016” (Language.oup.com 2016). Post-truth was coined in 1992 in essay by Serbian-American drama writer Steve Tesich in the Nation Magazine followed the shameful truth “the Watergate syndrome” moreover, assuaged coverage of the Iran–Contra scandal and Persian Gulf War demonstrate that “we, as a free people, have freely decided that we want to live in some post-truth world (Flood, 2016), (Kreitner, 2016).

The “post-truth era” in (Keyes, Ralph 2004), in the same year American journalist Eric Alterman spoke of a “post-truth political environment” used as term “post-truth presidency” and analysed misleading statements made by Bush administration after 9/11 (Alterman, 2004). The phrase “post-democracy” as a model of politics where “elections certainly exist and can change governments” while “public electoral debate is a tightly controlled spectacle, managed by rival teams of professionals expert in the techniques of persuasion and considering a small range of issues Crouch directly attributes the “advertising industry model” of political communication to the crisis of trust and accusations of dishonesty that a few years later others have associated with post-truth politics (Crouch, 2004).

Grist (2010) thinks Christopher H. Achen and Larry M. Bartels (2006) It is cognitive consistency, perception base, followed theory of voting issues of proximity “vote choice” they

are unknown just they feel that they are thinking: the rationalizing voter and electoral democracy (Achen & Bartels, 2006)

Grist (2010) Post-truth has its two parts of process:

- A. **Voters:** 1) Gather facts. 2) Conclusions of facts, 3) positions based on the conclusions 4) choose a political party that shares those issued positions.

The best evidence from political science shows that the process is:

- B. **Exactly the Reverse. Voters:** 1) choose a tribe or party base on value affiliations 2) adopt the issue positions of the tribe, 3) The arguments support those issue positions 4) chose facts to boost arguments.

.....

The “post-truth politics” by blogger David Roberts in a blog post (Grist, 2010) about climate, politics, culture, public opinion, media narratives and disconnection of policy and legislation (Jeffery, 2017). Post-truth generalised in 2016 presidential campaign in the US and referendum on EU membership in UK (Freedland, 2016) by Trump and Brexit campaign existed in end (Drezner, 2016). Prof. Jennifer Hochschild of Harvard University. Jayne stated that media was very, very, very patrician, over far of the 18th and 19th centuries, the concept of impartial, fair and balance in media is really a king of mid-20th century phenomena (Pazzanese, 2016). A Vote Leave poster with a misleading claim about EU Membership fee, cited an example of post-truth politics (Simons, 2016).

Post-truth politics is a campaign to repeat their conversational points, even if these are found untrue by media or independent experts (Preston, 2012) technique found in Pakistani in a large range. For example, the campaign of British EU referendum as campaign Vote Leave the claim the EU membership “cost £350 million” were found “potentially misleading” by the UK Statistics Authority as “not sensible” by the Institute for Fiscal Studies and rejected in fact-checks by BBC News, Channel4 News and Full Fact (Reuben, 2016) & (Worrall, 2015) Voter Leave nevertheless continued to use the figure as a centrepiece of their campaign until the day of the referendum, after what point and downplayed the pledge as an example pointing out that it was suggested as possible alternative use of the net fund sent to the EU (Stone, 2016).

Tory MP and Leave campaigner Sarah Wollaston, who left the group in protest during its campaign, criticised its post-truth politics (Simons, 2016). Michael Deacon, parliamentary sketch writer summarised post-truth politics as facts are negative, pessimistic and unpatriotic. Post-truth politics includes a claimed rejection of partnership and negative campaigning (Deacon, 2016). In this context, campaigners push a utopian “positive campaign” that rebuttals can be dismissed as smeared, scaremongering and opposition as partisan (Grist, 2010 & Michael Deacon 2016). In its most extreme mode, post-truth politics can make use of conspiracism (Boston, 2015) & (Cillizza, 2016). In this form of post-truth politics, false rumours such as the “Birther” or “Muslim” conspiracy theories about President Obama (Harsin, 2015).

CCTV News influence audiences, one prime objective to de-legitimize institutions, including the structures of government, democracy and human rights. Trust in the mainstream media in the US has reached historical lows. It is suggested that under these conditions’ fact-checking by news outlets struggles to gain traction among the wider public (Drezner 2016). Media debate produces post-truth political environment, political campaign, public space encouraging post-truth environment (Sambrook, 2012), moreover, politicians’ resort to increasingly drastic messaging and less trust of the public on their leaders (Alcorn, 2014).

Social Media advertisement an additional dimension, as the networks that users create can become echo chambers possible emphasised by the filter bubble where one political viewpoint dominates and scrutiny of claims fails, moreover, Modi's education and patient Lesner was considered as post-truth political campaign (Gopalakrishnan, 2016) and (Tett, 2016) and allowing a parallel media ecosystem of websites, publishers and news channels to develop which can repeat post-truth claims without rebuttal (Boston, 2015). In this environment, post-truth campaigns ignore fact checks or dismiss them as being motivated by biasness (Cillizza, 2016). The blame on the rise of click bait articles of dubious factual content misleading headlines, designed to be shared, saying that "chasing down cheap clicks at the expense of accuracy and variety" undermines the value of journalism and truth (Viner, 2016).

David Mikkelson founder of the fact checking and debunking site snopes.com, described the introduction of social media and fake news sites as a turning point, unsurely, post-truth age opens the sluice-gate and everything is pouring through. The bilge keeps coming faster (Carroll, 2016). News outlets are bound by rules to ensure impartiality, leading to false balance where minority view points are given undue emphasis and exaggerations or lies told during political campaigns are not adequately challenged (Preston, 2012) & (Krugman, 2011). The 24 hours news cycle, requiring constant reporting and analysis, news channels repeatedly draw on the same public figures, benefiting politicians and presentation and personality have a larger impact on the audience than facts (Keyes, 2004), while the process of claim and counter-claim provide grist for days of news coverage at the expense of deeper analysis of the case (Gopalakrishnan, 2016). Jayson Harsin in 2015 termed "regime of post-truth" that encompasses many aspects of post-truth politics. He argues that a convergent set of developments have created the conditions of post-truth society.

The rise of post-truth politics political polarization and media habits matched with polarized political beliefs found "with the most reliable ideological views on the left and right wing have information stream and are distinct from those of individuals with more mixed political views and very distinct from each other" (Mitchell, Amy Mitchell, 2016).

Disobedient views, in an editorial, New Scientist "a cynic might wonder if politicians are actually more dishonest than they used to be", hypothesized that "figs once whispered into select eras are now overheard by everyone". Similarly, Viner suggested that social media has helped some untruths to spread, it has restrained others; as an example, she said the sun's false "the truth" story following the Hillsborough disaster and the associated police cover-up, would be hard to imagine in the social media age (Viner, 2016).

The term of (Young, 2016) a "cliché" used selectively primarily by left-wing commentators to attack what are actually universal ideological biases, saying "we are all post-truthers and probably always have been". However, argument "complacent", identifying a qualitative difference between political scandals of previous generations, such as those surrounding the Suez Crisis and the Iran-Contra affair, which involved to cover-up the truth and contemporary ones in which public facts are simply ignored (Economist, 2016). Similarly, post truth campaign for the Poynter Institute said that political lies were not new and identified several historical political campaigns, which would now be described as post-truth and that the label was in part a "coping mechanism for commentators reacting to attack on not just any facts, but on those central to their belief system" but also noted that 2016 had been "an acrimonious year for politics on both sides of the Atlantic" (Mantzaris, 2016, p. opinion), also noted that interest in fact-checking had never been higher, suggesting that at least part of the electorate rejects post-truth politics (Mantzaris, 2016).

Journalist Sam Kriss said about post-truth: “not advocating the practice of lying to people, but the power that politics offers to think of something that does not exist, under any kind of very strict definition would be considered untrue and decide that you would like it to become true, so he thinks the question is what kind of untruth we want? The long history of elites found troubling the “truth” in politics and why, we might not want politics to be purely truthful? (Kriss, 2016)

Uses of post truth: politics applied as a political buzzword to a wide range of political cultures one article in the economist identified post-truth politics in Austria, Germany, North Korea, Poland, Russia, Turkey, the United Kingdom and the Unites state (Economist, 2016) and in Pakistan in 2019.

Propaganda in Germany: In 2016 “Postfaktisch” means post-truth was named word of the year by the Gesellschaft für deutsche Sprache (German language society), in the connection with a recent rise of right-wing populism:

Propaganda as Model conceptualised in to these 5 filters 1) Ownership 2) Advertisement 3) Expert as source 4) Flak as discipline in Media and 5) Anti-communism as Ideology by (Herman & Chomsky, 2002) in the new technological and economic condition propaganda model revised by Andrey Mir sorted these filters: 1) Reader revenue 2) Flak 3) ideology of the threat 4) sourcing and 5) ownership. The revised model found replace advertisement with reader revenue according to (Mir, 2021).

Britain: An early use of the phrase in British politics in March 2012 by Scottish Labour MSP Iain Gray in criticising the difference between Scottish National Party’s claims and official statistics (Gray, 2012). Scottish Labour leader Jim Murphy also described an undercurrent of post-truth politics in which people “cheerfully shot the messenger” when presented with facts that did not support their viewpoint, seeing it among pro-independence campaigners in the 2014 Scottish independence referendum, Jeremy Corbyn supporters in the 2015 Labour leadership election and Leave campaigners in the EU membership referendum (Murphy, 2015).

Post-truth politics retroactively identified in the lead-up to the Iraq War (Dunt, 2016). Chilcot Report in July 2016, concluded Tony Blair misrepresented military intelligence supported his views that Iraq's advanced chemical weapons. The phrase was widely used during the 2016 UK EU membership referendum to describe the Leave campaign, “post-fact politics” imported from the Trump campaign; in particular, people had enough of experts’ singled out as illustrative of a post-truth (Drezner, 2016), (Smith & Bishop, 2016) and (Flinders, 2016).

Similarly, Arron Bank, the founder of Leave. EU campaign, “facts don’t work with people emotionally. It’s the Trump success”, Andrea Leadsom a prominent campaigner for Leave in EU referendum and candidates in the conservative leadership election singled out as a post-truth politician (Deacon, 2016). Especially after she denied having disparaged rival in spite of transcript evidence (Katherine Viner 2016).

India: Similarities between trump and Brexit campaigns on the one hand and hot-button issued in India the “Ishrat Jahan” case “LeT fidayeen” against, where accusation of forged evidence and historical revisionism have resulted in an “ideological impasse” and fake counter on 7 September 2009 in Ahmadabad (Gopalakrishnan, 2016) and (TNM-staff, 2016).

United States: The phrase “post-truth politics” described paradoxical situation in the United States where the Republican Party enforced stricter party discipline than the Democratic Party, supporting Republican policies than vice versa (Grist, 2010). The term used by Paul Krugman to describe Mitt Romney’s 2012 presidential campaign claimed that Barak Obama cut defence spending and embarked on an “apology tour” continued to be repeated long after

being debunked (Krugman, 2011). Christopher Robichaud, conspiracy theories about the legitimacy of elections and politicians the "Birther" idea that Barak Obama is not a natural-born US citizen as one side-effect of post-truth politics and contrasted the behaviour of the candidates in 2000 election, The Humanist saw a rise in conspiracy theories across American public life, including Birtherism, denying climate change and rejecting evolution, identified as post-truth politics, existence of extensive and widely available evidence against these conspiracy theories had not solved their growth (Boston, 2015).

In 2016, the "post-truth" labelled to describe the presidential campaign of Boris Johnson and Donald Trump included a killer of democracy by the (Morris, 2016), (Drezner, 2016), (Freedland, 2016), (Cillizza, 2016), (Heer, 2015), (Kerchick, 2016) and by several professors of government and history at Harvard (Pazzanese, 2016). Reportedly, trump himself sourced of some related misinformation (Holliway, 2017). In 2016 US presidential election, Barak Obama said new media ecosystem "means everything is true and nothing is true" (Remnick, 2016) and (Mitchell, Gottfried, Jocelyn, & Masta, 2014).

In Australia, the repeal of carbon pricing by the government of Tony Abbott was described as "the nadir of post-truth politics".

Original Work:

Pakistan is a South Asian country with the population of 223.0 million 48.5% female and 51.5% male, its 37.3% population living in urban and 62.7% living in rural areas of the country. Its total 61.34 million internet users in these 83.5% using google chrome, 46.00 million social media users and 173.2 million mobile users all users more than 92% Pakistan Telecommunication Authority (PTA) and Pakistan Tele Communication Company's broadband (Pakistan, 2021).

Post-truth a great disruption in 21st century, post-truth politics statements in media spreading message globally and social media users take these debates seriously and discuss post-truth politics as national debate (Naureen, 2019). The quote of Pakistan Army critic, Christine Fair "*Pakistan collapse*" hopefully happens not that the chaos and post-truth statement generators and traitors attacking Pakistan while the bond between Pakistan Army and the People will not be broken. Someone Stigmatising "*change*" as political engineering in the election 2018, while Pakistan Army safeguarding Baluchistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Gilgit Baltistan (Naureen & Waqar, 2020).

Sometime hoax video viewers seriously, miss information over the internet, low trust on the news source were found fake, miss information, hoaxes circulation on the internet and social media, sensational stories to increase the channel rating for their advertisement. Four characteristics found by Ali (2019) 1) Origin of the news source, 2) To follow the content, 3) Strong editorial quality and caption, 4) Knowledge base research skills and general knowledge. The dawn news analysed Trump's polarisation of "Fake-news" as post-truth against liberal media, some found malicious campaign, accountability, criticism, artificial intelligence, miss/diss information, against the others, the surety of one narrative (their own) exists (Dawn, 2019).

Academically understand the post-truth in South Asia as an electoral discourse in Pakistan (Kurishi, 2021) cited in aposs.ac author by (Kuraishi, 2021) & (docplayer.net, 2021). Post-truth illustrated and conceptualized the trend of political issues, 1205 news articles and elections speeches from three major English Newspapers (Dawn, The New International and Express Tribune) circulated in electoral years 2008, 2013 and 2018 were analysed with Glynos and Howarth 2007 Fantasmatic logic and Lancanian logic of lack and fantasy allowed to separate text which categorised as post-truth online experiment towards ethically, religiously, politically stable in developing democratizing countries like Pakistan.

Pakistan is a multi-party country in 2018 Election Commission of Pakistan enlisted 105 political parties PTI one of that for election participation (ECP, Download, 2018) in this article the ruling party of Pakistan PTI heading by Prime Minister of Pakistan was taken as case study and their post-truth statements.

Ruling party of Pakistan

Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI) founded by the famous Cricketer and social worker Imran Khan on 25th April 1996 in Lahore, in 2002 general elections first time succeeded 15th party position with 160686 votes according to (ECP, Party positions, 2002) only 10 political parties succeeded to present the parliament. One seat of National Assembly of District Mianwali won by Imran Khan and another provincial seat in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) won by Nisar Khan from district Karak. Imran Khan is a Chairman of PTI (1996-2021) supported the Musharraf Referendum of 30th April 2002 later on apologised his un-constitutional act on the mainstream media. In 2008 general election PTI boycotted with Jumati Islami (JI), and Mehmood Khan's Pakhtunkhwa Milli Awami Party (PMAP) in alliance. In 2010 Imran Khan raised a political campaign and won 2013 general elections the election in KP and governed in collation with JI and Qumi Watan Party (QWP) of Aftab Ahmad Khan. Imran Khan refused to join hand with Musharraf when he announced grand alliance of 23 political parties as Pakistan Awami Itihad (PAI) and decided to bring change alone (Hussain, 2017). PTI launched Azadi March from 14th August 2014 to 17th December 2014 (GNAD, 2021). The "Azadi March" setting "dharna" was finished due to terrorist attack on Peshawar School on 16 December 2014.

Pakistan General Elections was held on 25th July 2018 in the whole country, the current ruling party PTI central-right-wing promised their manifesto of 2018 as "*The Road to Naya*" Pakistan. PTI succeeded 156 seats of National Assembly (NA) and leading PM chair in Pakistan. PTI headed KP and Punjab CM chairs and in collation in Baluchistan with total 297 Provincial assembly seats in Pakistan. PTI's collation government allies are MQM, GDA, APML, JWP in federal, PML-Q in federal and Punjab and BAP in Baluchistan heading CM Chair.

Post-truth in manifesto

The PTI manifesto "The Road to Naya Pakistan" as known as "change" and "Naya Pakistan" (PTI, 2018), the web page of PTI (insaf.pk, 2021) and few selected speeches of party leaders were analysed as primary data. Were found elite oriented and post-truth statements were found that PTI in every situation want to hold the PM (Prime Minister) Chair as a ruling party of Pakistan.

Each problem was promised to be solved and the famous words were promised such times "We will 280 times, ensure 87, change 32, transform 53, champion 30, launch 28" words were used as commitment and agreement. KP presented as learning and success case for future ruling on federal level in Pakistan. Naya Pakistan was used six-time, Capacity building 12, to build 31, Establish 34, create 36, implement 34, times were presented as campaign strategy. Strengthen, improve, increase, launch, create, peruse, solve, build, invest, improvement and research in every field were committed in each point. Surety of public and private partnership was ensured in every field. Each point of manifesto as problem was identified and ensured to transform that particular problems. The criticized fields were ensured, promised, committed to establish, champion, reform, transform with skilled and experience human resource capital. FATA now merged in KP, Baluchistan, South Punjab considered as neglected areas of Pakistan by the government and minorities were denied from the beginning to 2018. PTI exaggerated the governing of KP as achievements but write wrongly the KP spelling in manifesto. Fata

integration, Baluchistan reconciliation, South Punjab province creation, transformation of Karachi, political and socio-economic empowerment of GB. The poverty problems in poorest district of Pakistan. Poverty and its problems in all provinces. Minorities' rights, problems were promised while minorities in Pakistan considered denied in the previous 70 years and linked with the Jinnah vision to give the constitutional rights to minorities.

PTI used word "our and we" in a major points and present Pakistan as their own country and its problems were committed to solve and exaggerated their patriotism in their manifesto.

Repetition of corruption, tax, IT sector, export, were found in maximum part of the manifesto. Pakistan's repressive policies, previous reforms, international agreements criticised by PTI in every field and committed to champions Example: Finance system of Malaysia, IT sector of India in export were appreciated to follow it. Gross negligence of agriculture sector in precious criticized.

Improvement, implementation, incensement, achievements, progress in every field were committed. Ensured youth policy with 3Es model (education, employment and engagement) to create educated, skilled and young youth for the better future of Pakistan as youth policy. presented Foreign, Defence and commerce ministries as safeguard "Pakistan national security" in their manifesto.

PTI promised Inclusive Economic Growth were committed as Chapter IV, "the Creation of 10 million Jobs and strengthen of labour market" was committed:

Create 10 million jobs and strengthen the labour market

PTI will strengthen the labour market and create 10 million jobs over 5 years in key sectors: SME, housing, ICT, health, education, green economy and tourism.

Source: PTI Manifesto 2018 P. 27

The second commitment was promised 50,00000 houses:

Implement policy framework to build five million houses

PTI will play the role of an enabler and facilitator, but not developer, to build 5 million low cost housing units. We will ensure the development of 1.5 to 2 million urban and 3 to 3.5 million rural housing units.

Source: PTI Manifesto 2018 P. 28

"And implementation policy framework to build five million houses" P.28

Data analysis:

Internationally political communication qualitatively analysed that the propaganda messages, fake news, lie statements, falsehood stories, untruth news and post-truth pictures were found as group of post-truth phenomena which internationally using by political leaders and its parties to convince the public as voters.

Pakistan people naturally criticising the ruling party in every epoch and its ruling party presenting state in at risk:

Pakistan neighbourhood, survival challenges, national narrative, risk base strategy, domestic media challenges, political sponsorship, civil military relation, general political and religious narrative problems, negative perception about Pakistan in international arena. These all problems generating post-truth politics debates. But negativism affecting youth, state

institutions, state policies, making difficult governance and strategic chaos, while the Pakistan Army sustained the state security and public like their Army.

The emotionally statement of responsible person in politics is called post-truth here in Pashto language Pashtun culturally called it “Doza” the person who saying post-truth is called “Dozmar”. Leaders over the stage spraying phony facts, which passes into history result-less, democrats (left wing) and republican (right wing).

In Pakistan few media popular messages were analysed and found more popularity as Post-truth Politics in Pakistan. These post-truth messages committed by politicians as long term and short term to change the people perception in to their party support and supporters. Political leaders committed their speeches and party policies to propagate their messages in media debates, they communicated the “Drone attacks” in the Merger districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, “Absolutely Not” the interview of PM Imran Khan, PML president promised to eradicate the electricity problems in six months, while chairman Asif Ali Zardari stated politicians committing promise to break it. Federal minister Faisal Vawda placed military shoe over the table in media debate over the extension bill of Army chief in Pakistan’s parliament. Even in the manifestos religious parties promised the “System of Mustafa”, “Islamic System” and PTI promised “Riyasat-e-Madina” charter of Madina committed and promised by the political parties in Pakistan, moreover all the parties were found to eradicate the inflation and budget deficit were found the post-truth political messages.

PTI leaders particularly know on their post-truth political statements were discussed in media debates over the main stream media in talk shows while get popularity on social media, public sphere and individually.

PM Imran Khan is on the top in Political post-truth their messages day by getting more popularity as joking and few are “change, do not worry, Ghabrananai, Absolutely Not were converted in absolutely yes, in the rap case the female is guilty as to wear their light dress. I will never keep sheikh Rasheed as servant. Pervez Elahi was considered the great thief, MQM as whole considered the killers while these parties now governing with PTI as a collation partners.

Even in the speeches to public gathering and in media talk Imran Khan and Asad Qaiser committed the justice for “Naqeebullah fake encounter” against Rao Anwar is the encounter officer responsible for the Naqeebullah Murder, is popular case as “Killing of Naqeebullah Mehsud” with 47 references on (wikipedia, 2018).

Murad Saeed popularised with 2 billion dollar for receiving and throwing over the mouth of IMF and my electricity and my choice. Sheryar Afridi’s “Army chief is the father of Nation, Photos of Rana Saullah case, which proved in court as a lie and political victimization. Ali Muhammad Khan’s religiosity, and he stated that his grand father was jailed with Quaid Azam M Ali Jinnah, in the reverse he stated I was wrong he was in Jailed in DI Khan in 1927. Pervez Khattak’s where is inflation? Asad Umar’s BRT in 8 billion while in practical they produce in 100 billion. Fawad Chaudhry was popularised as Albert Einstein on social due to their post-truth statements. Faisal Vawda’s provision of numerous jobs in a week, Sheikh Rashid’s produced countless post-truth.

On the daily bases Journalist Talat Hussain, Hamid mir, Salim Safi, Doctor Danish, discussing the post-truth statements a mocking and lie of the day or week of ruling politicians. The majority these post-truth statements were committed on flower of parliament on the responsible posts.

In the parliament Qadir Patail MNA said on the PM statements: Japan is on the border of Germany, Covid 19 is a flu and satisfaction will be in grave”

All the post-truth political statements proved by the economic and political situation of Pakistan and they all are the cabinet members they change their ministries due to post-truth or irresponsible statements.

Finding:

The above discussion and literature review and data analysis base the following findings are found as power elite oriented of media channel policies, ruling class, media worker's hierarchy, politicians and owners of the source:

1. Propaganda is based oriented message which blame other to present bad, good and characterless.
2. Fake news: produce by media worker as news this is the news responsibility that they keep themselves active updated and source-full.
3. Miss/diss information: is as intentionally wrong or right statements which priding by media workers, analysts, political analysis, politicians and individuals.
4. Post-truth: is conceptualized and separated as phenomena which is totally different phenomena from Propaganda, Fake-news, miss/diss information and sensational news while become in the group of Propaganda, Fake news, mis/dis information, sensational news, emotional news and beliefs, post-truth separated the message owner as noble, good and ethical while in the in-depth analysis or if fail the strategy the message owner has a revers option. Therefore, the most popular term in Pakistan which given by media opponent users of Imran Khan and he own it as a good strategy "U-Turn" is very popular in Pakistan. Imran Khan itself stand over this term that the good leader taking "U-Turn" it is the sustainable technique to produce post-truth over post-truth to keep people busy with himself.
5. Post-truth politics producing a belief system produced that joyfully gunshot the messenger and relegated opponents' truths to unkindly interested in their opinion. Populism is a pre-step of post-truth do not procure it. In the post-truth the owner consider himself as able and qualified.
6. Post-truth is a claim fails, miss leading headline, ignore fact check, motivating bise.

Conclusion:

The post-truth phenomenon is a natural human behaviour, but in 2016 it is repeated by Donald Trump US President which is dominant it previously used by everyone. Post-truth phenomena used by everyone in their context against the other that he considers himself as good and other as bad. But in 2016 the post-truth was propagated and dominated by media corporate in new shape. The people as audience like the new shape to blame other verses them as good. Theory of "they and us" the model of propaganda, agenda setting, framing, were used by the media and political elites, but during the election the same propaganda in media and politics used by elite to change the vote choice in a specific time. Every state's president attempting to protect their nation form risk in future. The elections in every country anywhere affecting by post-truth phenomena which covering by media in another words called propaganda, fake news and post-truth. The post-truth political messages internationally and national were found used by political parties, organizations, and government officers.

The "Vote Leave EU referendum of British and the "Road to Naya Pakistan" were found a similar post-truth campaign as political strategy as globally.

On the social media Facebook.com the 7 pages of Pashtu oriented "Doz, Dozmar and Dozmar Pashtun" and 11 pages of Urdu and Panjabi oriented were found on the name of

“Bongian” which criticizing the post-truth statements producing by the elite and individual in society.

In Pakistan PTI’s chairman Imran Khan and its core leaders use it as his special trend post-truth is their strategy the strategy is previously used by right politicians in their political campaign and now Imran khan use it in different strategical way as his unique approach therefore, he himself and his cabinet members intentionally provide post-truth statement and replace it on another post-truth statement. While their audience and follower enjoying their post-truth statements and taking seriously due to his personal influence as celebrity. It is found elite oriented phenomena every day or every week elite base the leaders of PTI deliberately produce post-truth statements to keep their political worker busy their worker following their post-truth statements on social media and public sphere day by day in their serious arguments, while PTI failed to commit single promise of contain, manifesto, and media debates which Imran Khan promised. This study has a lot of reading materials to extend it more in to others parties in more topics.

=====
***The author is a Freelance Journalist, Researcher, faculty member in University of Swabi and PhD scholar in Department of Journalism and Mass Communication, University of Peshawar.**

Acknowledgement:

Hassan Yar Khalil lecturer in English at Islamia College University Peshawar, acknowledged for proof reading and necessary grammatical corrections.

References

- Achen, C. H., & Bartels, L. M. (2006). *It Feels Like We're Thinking: The Rationalizing Voter and Electoral Democracy*. Philadelphia: American Political Science Association. Retrieved from <https://grist.org/wp-content/uploads/2010/04/thinking.pdf>
- Alcorn, G. (2014, 02 28). Facts are futile in an era of post-truth politics. *The Sydney Morning Herald*, p. Opinion. Retrieved from <https://www.smh.com.au/opinion/facts-are-futile-in-an-era-of-posttruth-politics-20140227-33m70.html>
- Ali, W. (2019, 12 28). Living in a post-truth world. *Dawn News*, p. Article. Retrieved from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1524909>
- Alterman, E. (2004). *When Presidents Lie: A History of Official Deception and Its Consequences*. New York: Viking. p. 305. New York:: Viking Adult.
- Boston, R. (2015, 12 22). Humanists and the Rise of "Post-Truth America. *The Humanist*. Retrieved from thehumanist.com/magazine/january-february-2016/church-state/humanists-rise-post-truth-america
- Carroll, R. (2016, 08 01). Can mythbusters like Snopes.com keep up in a post-truth era? *The Guardian*, p. Opinion. Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/technology/2016/aug/01/snopes-com-internet-fact-checker-post-truth-david-mikkelson>
- Caulfield, J. (2019, 11 08). *A quick guide to textual analysis*. Retrieved from Scribbr: <https://www.scribbr.com/methodology/textual-analysis/>
- Cillizza, C. (2016, 05 10). Donald Trump's post-truth campaign and what it says about the dismal state of US politics. *The Independent*. Retrieved from <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/americas/donald-trump-campaign-republican-us-election-2016-what-it-says-about-a7022276.html>
- Crouch, C. (2004). *Post-democracy*. Cambridge: Polity.
- Dawn. (2019, 10 2). Post-truth world. *Dawn News*, p. Opinion. Retrieved from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1508510>
- Deacon, M. (2016, 07 09). In a world of post-truth politics, Andrea Leadsom will make the perfect PM. *The Daily Telegraph*. Retrieved from <https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2016/07/09/in-a-world-of-post-truth-politics-andrea-leadsom-will-make-the-p>
- docplayer.net. (2021, 05 04-08). *docplayer.net*. Retrieved 09 14, 2021, from docplayer.net/206742070-The-second-helsinki-conference-on-emotions-populism-and-polarisation-tuesday-4-may-saturday-8-may-2021.html
- Drezner, D. W. (2016, 06 16). Why the post-truth political era might be around for a while. *The Washington Post*, p. Article. Retrieved from <https://www.washingtonpost.com/posteverything/wp/2016/06/16/why-the-post-truth-political-era-might-be-around-for-a-while/>
- Dunt, I. (2016, 06 29). Post-truth politics is driving us mad . *Politics*, p. opinion.
- Economist. (2016, 09 10). The post-truth world: Yes, I'd lie to you. *The Economist*, p. Editorial. Retrieved from <https://www.economist.com/briefing/2016/09/10/yes-id-lie-to-you>
- ECP. (2002). *Party positions*. Retrieved from Election commission of Pakistan: www.ecp.gov.pk
- ECP. (2018, 08 29). *Download*. Retrieved from Election Commission of Pakistan: www.ecp.gov.pk
- Flinders, M. (2016, 07 03). Post-truth, post-political, post-democracy: the tragedy of the UK's referendum on the European Union. *OUPblog*, p. web. Retrieved from <https://blog.oup.com/2016/07/post-political-democracy-uk-referendum/>
- Flood, A. (2016, 11 15). Post-truth' named word of the year by Oxford Dictionaries. *The Guardian*, p. Article.
- Freedland, J. (2016, 05 13). Post-truth politicians such as Donald Trump and Boris Johnson are no joke. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from

- <https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2016/may/13/boris-johnson-donald-trump-post-truth-politician>
- GNAD. (2021, 09 18). *Pakistan's Azadi March to Overthrow Prime Minister, 2014*. Retrieved from Global Nonviolent Action Database: <https://nvdatabase.swarthmore.edu/content/pakistans-azadi-march-overthrow-prime-minister-2014>
- Gopalakrishnan, A. (2016, 06 30). Life in post-truth times: What we share with the Brexit campaign and Trump. *The Times of India*, p. Opinion. Retrieved from <https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/blogs/to-name-and-address/everything-but-the-truth-what-we-share-with-the-brexit-campaign-and-trump/>
- Gray, I. (2012, 03 01). Beware the black art of post-truth politics. *The Scotsman*, p. Opinion.
- Grist. (2010, 04 01). Post-Truth Politics. *Grist Post-Truth Politics*, p. Article. Retrieved from <https://grist.org/article/2010-03-30-post-truth-politics>: <https://grist.org/article/2010-03-30-post-truth-politics>
- Harsin, J. (2015, 02 24). Regimes of Posttruth, Postpolitics, and Attention Economies. *Communication, Culture & Critique*, 8(2).
- Heer, J. (2015, 12 1). Donald Trump Is Not a Liar; He's something worse: a bullshit artist. *The New Republic*. Retrieved from <https://newrepublic.com/article/124803/donald-trump-not-liar>
- Herman, E., & Chomsky, N. (2002, 9 16). *A Propaganda Model*. Retrieved from Chomsky.Info: <https://chomsky.info/consent01/>
- Holliday, K. (2017, 01 12). Conspirator in chief: 14 fake news stories created or publicized by Donald Trump. *AlterNet*.
- Hussain, J. (2017, 11 10). Musharraf has announced a "grand alliance" of 23 political parties. *Dawn News*, p. News. Retrieved from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1369641>
- insaf.pk. (2021, 09 18). *About*. Retrieved from Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf: <https://insaf.pk/what-is-pti>
- Jeffery, T. (2017, 06 28). Britain Needs More Democracy After the EU Referendum, Not Less. *www.huffingtonpost.co.uk*, Article. Retrieved from https://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/tom-jeffery/britain-needs-more-democr_b_10699898.html
- Kerchick, J. (2016, 06 29). What Trump and the Brexiteers have in common. *Los Angeles Times*, p. opinion.
- Keyes, R. (2004). *The Post-Truth Era: Dishonesty and Deception in Contemporary Life*. New York: St. Martin's.
- Kreitner, R. (2016, 11 30). Post-Truth and Its Consequences: What a 25-Year-Old Essay Tells Us About the Current Moment. *The Nation*, p. Article. Retrieved from Post-Truth and Its Consequences: What a 25-Year-Old Essay Tells Us About the Current Moment". The Nation.
- Kriss, S. (2016, 09 09). It's Always Been "Post-Truth" Politics. *WYNC*, p. web. Retrieved from www.wnystudios.org/podcasts/otm/segments/its-always-been-post-truth-politics
- Krugman, P. (2011, 12 23). The Post-Truth Campaign. *The New York Times*, p. Opinion. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2011/12/23/opinion/krugman-the-post-truth-campaign.html>
- Kuraishi, A. (2021, 06 16). *aposs.cc*. Retrieved 09 16, 2021, from <https://aposs.cc/schedule/insights-from-south-asia-post-truth-and-public-opinion-in-pakistan-by-anam-kuraishi/>
- Kurishi, A. (2021). The Second Helsinki Conference on Emotions, Populism, and Polarisation Tuesday, 4 May Saturday, 8 May 2021. *The Second Helsinki Conference on Emotions, Populism, and Polarisation*. Finland: University of Helsinki. Retrieved 09 15, 2021, from https://www2.helsinki.fi/sites/default/files/atoms/files/hepp2_programme_17.04.pdf
- Language.oup.com. (2016). *languages.oup.com*. Retrieved 09 16, 2021, from <https://languages.oup.com/word-of-the-year/2016>
- Mantzaris, A. (2016, 10 07). Fact check: This is not really a post-fact election. *Washington Post*, p. Opinion.
- Mantzaris, A. (2016, 07 21). No, we're not in a 'post-fact' era. *Poynter*, p. Fact checking. Retrieved from <https://www.poynter.org/fact-checking/2016/no-were-not-in-a-post-fact-era/>
- Mills, C. W. (1998). *The Power Elite New Edition* (New Edition ed., Vol. New Edition). (A. b. 9780195133547, Ed.) New York, America: Oxford University .

- Mir, A. (2021, 01 17). *Human as Media*. Retrieved from The news media: manufacturing anger, not consent. Herman-Chomsky's Propaganda model revised: <https://human-as-media.com/2021/01/17/the-news-media-manufacturing-anger-not-consent-herman-chomskys-propaganda-model-revised-2/>
- Mitchell, A. (2016). *Amy Mitchell*. Washington, DC 20036: Pew Research Center. Retrieved from <https://www.pewresearch.org/staff/amy-mitchell/>
- Mitchell, A., Gottfried, J., Jocelyn, K., & Masta, K. E. (2014). *Political Polarization & Media Habits*. Pew Research Centre. Washington, DC 20036: Pew Research Centre. Retrieved from <https://www.pewresearch.org/journalism/2014/10/21/political-polarization-media-habits/>
- Morris, B. (2016, 06 19). Trump's lies aren't unique to America: Post-truth politics are killing democracies on both sides of the Atlantic. *Salon*, p. web. Retrieved from https://www.salon.com/2016/06/19/trumps_lies_arent_unique_to_america_post_truth_politics_are_killing_democracies_on_both_sides_of_the_atlantic
- Murphy, J. (2015, 09 23). We live in a volatile age of post-truth politics – and so Brexit cannot be ruled out. *New Statesman*, p. Opinion.
- Naureen, A. (2019, 30 01). Post truth challenges & Pakistan. *The News International*, p. Analysis Article. Retrieved from <https://nation.com.pk/30-Jan-2019/post-truth-challenges-pakistan>
- Naureen, A., & Waqar, U. (2020, 10 05). Post-truth chaos and Pakistan. *The News International*, p. Article. Retrieved from <https://tribune.com.pk/story/2267077/post-truth-chaos-and-pakistan>
- Pakistan, D. 2. (2021). *DIGITAL 2012: Pakistan*. Retrieved from <https://datareportal.com/reports/digital-2021-pakistan>
- Pazzanese, C. (2016, 07 14). *The Harvard Gazette*. Retrieved from <https://news.harvard.edu/gazette/story/2016/07/politics-in-a-post-truth-age/>
- Preston, P. (2012, 09 09). Tory MP Sarah Wollaston Switches Sides In EU Referendum Campaign. *Theguardian*, p. Opinion. Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/media/2012/sep/09/post-truth-politics-us-broadcasting>
- PTI. (2018). *The Road to Naya Pakistan*. Islamabad: Pakistan Tehreed-e-Insaf.
- Remnick, D. (2016, 11 28). Obama Reckons with A Trump PresidencyThe New Yorker. *The New Yorker*, p. web. Retrieved from <https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2016/11/28/obama-reckons-with-a-trump-presidency>
- Reuben, A. (2016, 04 15). Reality Check: Would Brexit mean extra £350m a week for NHS? *BBC Reality*, p. Reality check. Retrieved from <https://www.bbc.com/news/uk-politics-eu-referendum-36040060>
- Sambrook, R. (2012). *Delivering trust: Impartiality and objectivity in the digital age*. Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism. University of Oxford. Retrieved from <https://reutersinstitute.politics.ox.ac.uk/sites/default/files/2017-11/Delivering%20Trust%20Impartiality%20and%20Objectivity%20in%20a%20Digital%20Age.pdf>
- Simons, N. (2016, 06 09). Tory MP Sarah Wollaston Switches Sides In EU Referendum Campaign. *huffingtonpost*, p. Politics.
- Smith, M., & Bishop, R. (2016, 06 03). Post-truth politics: Michael Gove accused of 'importing Trump campaign' to Britain with £350m a week claim. *The Mirror*, p. web.
- Stone, J. (2016, 09 12). Vote Leave's £350m for the NHS pledge was 'just an example', says group's chair. p. Politics. Retrieved from <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/politics/gisela-stuart-vote-leave-s-ps350m-nhs-pledge-was-just-example-group-s-chair-says-a7238451.html>
- Tett, G. (2016, 07 01). (1 July 2016). "Why we no longer trust the experts". *Financial Times*, p. Opinion.
- TNM-staff. (2016, 02 11). *Ishrat Timelinne*. Retrieved from <https://www.thenewsminute.com/article/ishrat-jahan-timeline-not-first-time-david-headley-has-named-her-38850>
- Viner, K. (2016, 07 12). How technology disrupted the truth. *The Guardian*, p. Editorial. Retrieved from www.theguardian.com/media/2016/jul/12/how-technology-disrupted-the-truth

- wikipedia. (2018, 01 13). *wikipedia*. Retrieved from Killing of Nageebullah Mehsud:
https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Killing_of_Nageebullah_Mehsud
- Worrall, P. (2015, 10 9). Is Britain sending £350m a week to Brussels? *channel4*, p. FactCheck.
Retrieved from <https://www.channel4.com/news/factcheck/factcheck-send-350m-week-brussels>
- Young, T. (2016, 07 16). The truth about post-truth politics. *The Spectator.*, p. Article. Retrieved from
<https://www.spectator.co.uk/article/the-truth-about-post-truth-politics->