Teacher Recruitment Guideline for The Schools Conducting New Education System

Phiyapa Sirivedin

Office of the Teacher Civil Service and Personnel Commission
Ministry of Education, Thailand

Abstract

This study aimed to investigate the condition, problems, needs and problem solutions including factors contributing to the success of teacher recruitment and retention. Fifty key informants from five Princess Chulabhorn Science High School (PCSHS) schools in five regions were selected. In-depth and focus group interview with semi-structured interview were used to collect data. Collected data were analyzed with content analysis method. Findings revealed similar recruiting condition to general institutions in three forms: recruiting from central and provincial exams; recruiting from transfer; and recruiting from scholarship students. Five problems were lack of decentralization recruiting policy; lack of school participation; lack of fairness; lack of planning; and other issues such as lack of motivation. Five needs consisted of schools' teachers recruiting independence; personnel's participation; committee consideration in teacher selection, decision-making, and setting teachers qualifications such as receiving above Master degree education or honors award; long-term planning; and teachers motivating. Five solutions were to improve existing personnel by networks; provide special payment; procure extra budgets for recruiting; organize mentoring system; recruit by schools themselves. Factors for the success of the recruitment and retention were transparent policies; various appropriate and fair rules and procedures; clear structure and system; and attractive incentives. The findings concluded with five key recruiting guidelines: decentralization; participation; transparency; future-oriented recruitment for teachers maintaining; and diversity-based recruitment. Besides, six teacher recruitment methods for specific school like PCSHS were proposed: the recruiting by exams; by scholarship; by school funding; by personnel transfer; by school personnel selection; and by school or committee nomination.

Keywords: factors, personnel, policy, selection, solution

1.   Introduction

Princess Chulabhorn Science High School (PCSHS) is a group of institutes conducting new education system focusing on science and mathematics. The goal of the study is to find out the appropriate teacher recruitment system in order to solve the problems on its quality of teachers. Also, it is to find out the effective guideline for creating educational management policy to set up the teacher quality in the same standard of overseas institutes in both current and future context. A new educational system means the system such in the institutes that established with a special purpose: specialized education or bilateral studies, which promote and create learners' special abilities and educational excellence. Therefore, it is necessary to recruit appropriate teaching personnel who are excellent in transferring knowledge, experience and skills to learners to achieve such purpose.

The world's best practice in teacher recruiting system of leading institutions such as the National Institute of Technology showed a distinctive identity in terms of independence, transparency and interference-free (GPO, 2 0 2 0) resulting from government policies and distribution policies. The policy of Japan's Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology (MEXT) allows each institute college to be able to set rules and procedures for personnel recruiting to independently select their own teachers. It is to attract and motivate interested person to enter the system, especially those who held knowledge, abilities, experience, advanced skills, including the excellence in transferring those knowledge, experiences and skills to learners. Best practices of Japan's National Institute of Technology (NIT) revealed five main teacher qualifications, namely, skills and experiences; educational level (Ph.D.); educational background; academic and research publication; and self-reputation (attitude, vision, belief) (OTEPC, 2020).

PCSHS is the group of institutes in the Office of the Basic Education Commission (OBEC) under the supervision of the Ministry of Education. They provide new teaching methods in order to develop learners with special abilities, such in science, mathematics, and technology, to the same standards as leading international science schools. Yet, it is not possible to set rules, regulations and criteria for recruiting specific teachers for themselves. Thus, it still uses the same rules, regulations and criteria for recruiting teachers as other normal schools. The rules only defines a broad scope such in the criteria for determining the qualifications of government teachers that require only a minimum bachelor's degree in education or as prescribed by Office of the Teacher Civil Service and Educational Personnel Commission: OTEPC (Education Council, 2017). The procedures and methods of recruiting are not in a specific and non-individual form which creates difficulties in recruiting specific person. Actually, the right and appropriate qualifications and requirements of the school affect the development of teaching and learning management quality and learner quality. It also affects the morale of the teachers who perform their duties. Thus, the researcher studied the concepts, theories, policies, rules, regulations and best practices including related research summarizing as follow.

The theories of policy change compares the traditional view of institutions to the view that institutions or organizations are holistic, stationary and unchanging while the new perspective sees an institution or organization as composed of dynamic and changing sub-units (Cerna, 2013). Concept of Institutional Change theory (Bennett & Howlett, 1992; Streeck & Thelen, 2005) states that policy, rules and regulations can be changed and transferred from large to small units. The power within the organization transferred from higher to lower level through communicating of the needs and participation from lower-level. Benefit of this process is the enhancement of lower-level strength to be able to create their fair recruiting and their success in selecting qualified peoples they require (Ter-Minassian, 1997; Wongsarsri, 1999). The open selection process ensures the fairness and transparency recruitment (Mankikar, 2014) under the merit system bringing the satisfaction of personnel (Bhoganadam & Rao, 2014). Besides, high-level of success in teacher recruitment and maintenance depends on the use of various methods: open and closed system or internal and external recruiting; including open policy that allow all target groups with equal opportunity (Niglo, 1959). This is beneficial to acquire applicants with proper knowledge, competence, experience, expertise and qualifications required to access the recruiting application (McCullagh et al., 2014). Additionally, this is to open the chance for applicants within the organization to access the vacant positions which are time and cost efficacy in training or motivating them (Ketkajornnan, 1998).

The concept of centralization and decentralization stated that centralization is the empowerment of limited scope that is impossible for sub-units to make their own decisions about their needs which affect the management of important matters (Hutchcroft, 2002; Mok, 2004; Marume & Jubenkanda, 2016) Decentralization provides opportunities for lower-level agencies to involve in the decision-making process or to be able to make decisions on their own (Surbhi, 2017).

The concept of participation concludes that providing stakeholders at all levels the opportunity to participate in their opinions or even to make decisions that will affect their lives (Devas & Grant, 2003). It is a very effective benefit, i.e. participation opportunities can enhance the capabilities of stakeholders at all levels and create incentives for more sustainable and efficient problem solving and resource management (Agarwal, 2001). The organization will have a greater chance of success in its operations (Chamala, 1995) by being given opportunities to allocate sufficient resources that are appropriate and meet the needs. It will also enhance and create a sense of ownership and a sense of responsibility for various actions to be successful and completed in the right way as well (Agarwal, 2001).

The concept of recruiting context emphasizes the key to the success of an organization which is recruiting personnel who can meet the success of the organization's goals (Mathis & Jackson, 2010). When the organization selects personnel that match the job and provide good training and take proper care of them, these personnel will not only create good results for the organization but still tend to remain in that organization for longer (Anand et al., 2018). Recruitment policies consist of two types: recruiting from within the organization for the advantage of morale building and training and incentive budgets saving. The downside is its limited options and lack of new innovation thought. Besides, recruiting from outside the

102

organization has advantages with a variety of options and attracts a person with knowledge, skills, and new ideas. Their disadvantages are the waste of budget and affect morale resulting in a negative atmosphere (Niglo, 1959). Recruiting principles are divided into two systems: the patronage system which allows people who are not qualified to cause damage to the organization. The moral system is an important principle which eliminates the patronage system by adhering to the principles of equality, competence, and security. Only personnel with appropriate knowledge and excellent abilities will be obtained (Britannica, 2019; The Free Dictionary by Farlex, 2019). To empower and motivate the problem solving in fairness, school and stakeholder participation is suggested for fostering a more responsible sense in sustainable and efficient resource management (Mankikar, 2014). The recruiting principle component consists of principles and important concepts or objectives, the recruitment process, the determination of key qualifications or capabilities that are desirable, recruiting methods, selection process and selection criteria (Iyer, 2018).

Factors affecting recruitment include experiential factors such as work and education experience; eligibility factors such as educational qualifications, educational establishments, marital status, culture, especially the culture of the institution where the degree was graduated, religion and language; skill factors; and competence factors (Roja et al., 2018-2019; Susairaj & Jenifer, 2018). Additionally, the best practice of teacher qualifications setting regarding education level such as Master or Ph.D. degree is used by Japan's National Institute of Technology (NIT). It is because both specific knowledge and research skill and experience based on their educational background are the requirement for outstanding institutes conducting specific teaching and learning system (OTEPC, 2020).

Conditions or incentives for recruiting may be in the form of monetary and non-monetary items such as working conditions, working atmosphere, work system, organizational culture, salary and benefits, higher compensation, creating development opportunities, goal setting, and clear results and good intentions of the organization. Therefore, changes in the recruitment process greatly affect the work and persistence of personnel (Bhoganadam & Rao, 2014; Susairaj & Jenifer, 2018).

Thus, OTEPC aims to apply study results to develop the specific, appropriate, up-to-date, fair and universal rules, regulations and criteria of teachers' recruitment for schools conducting new educational system. The conditions, problems, solutions to problems, needs and factors for successful teacher recruiting in order to synthesize guidelines and models for teacher recruitment and retention were investigated. A case study of specific educational institute, PCSHS, was conducted in order to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of teachers' performance, create happiness and satisfaction for school administrators, teachers, parents, learners, and other stakeholders. This leads to the development of educational quality, teacher quality, teaching quality and learner quality.

2.   Methods

A qualitative case study design was used to find a guideline for instructors' recruitment of the institutes conducting new education system. Research methods are divided into 3 stages as follow.

Stage 1 Preparation stage was a study of knowledge, concepts and theories from both offline and online documents: textbooks, books, laws, circulars, statutes, research papers, articles, thesis papers, opinion reports, publications of institutions both in Thailand and abroad and information from various websites on the internet. The concepts of future-oriented education policies and strategies, concepts and policies on education in Thailand and abroad, recruiting system, concept on recruiting government teachers in Thailand and abroad, best practices in recruiting teachers, and related research were reviewed. The results were used to create a semi-structured interview questions for the in-depth interviews and group interviews.

Stage 2 Process stage was the step of conducted in-depth interview and group interview with key informants. Data were collected by note taking, observations notes and digital recordings.

Stage 3 Conclusion stage was to analyze, summarize, and synthesize for drafted designs of teacher recruitment guidelines and model as well as policy recommendations for the development of teacher recruitment system. Completeness and consistency of the research results were verified by seven experts.

2.1 Participants

Five targets sample schools were selected from all twelve PCSHS institutes in five regions using stratified sampling method. Totaling of fifty key informants was selected from all target schools by means of purposive sampling method. They consisted of four groups, namely, school administrators; school human resources officers, government teachers, and paid teachers who performed teaching.

2.2 Data Collection and Data Analysis

In-depth interview and group interview with semi-structured questions tool. The researcher records the answer to the question including the discussion, ideas exchanging and commenting through digital audio recorder and taking notes of observations during such operations. Collected data were analyzed and synthesized by content analysis method.

3.   Results

Results of the case study research were summarized into 3 parts: 1) condition, problems, needs and solutions to problems of teacher recruitment; 2) factors contributing to the success of recruiting and retention; and 3) guidelines for teachers recruiting for the institutes conducting new teaching-learning system.

3.1   Results on the condition, problems, needs and solutions to problems of teacher recruitment

3.1.1 Condition

The study of teacher recruitment condition revealed similar recruiting condition to general institutions in three forms: recruiting from central and provincial exams, recruiting from transfer, and recruiting from scholarship students. All government teachers were recruited by the provincial education office through the Office of Educational Service Areas (OESA) under the same regular system. A calculation of the proportion and the over or under rate of government teacher of regular system used for other schools is the same as of PCSHS. Similar recruiting system is in three forms: recruiting from central and provincial exams, recruiting from transfer, and recruiting from scholarship students.

1) Recruiting from central and provincial exams - the numbers of personnel in each subject was calculated due to the teaching hour which is in the same format for all schools. Special criteria were not used in the calculation for schools in PCSHS, which are schools with special-purpose teaching and learning system. The former traditional PCSHS consisted of teachers in every subject. Later, the school changed its teaching-learning model focusing on science, mathematics, and technology. For this reason, there was more demand for teachers in these three subjects than teachers in general subjects. As a result, the number of existing teachers exceeded in general subjects. Still, the normal vacancy rate is calculated as with other schools. As a result, schools are unable to be allocated a power increase rate, as school teachers call the "overload" condition. This means PCSHS has more teachers than they can afford but goes beyond the general subject, at the same time, there was a shortage of teachers in the necessary core subjects.

2) Recruiting from transfer - The existing teachers were mostly from recruiting by transfer dues to the constraints on the allocation of staffing by the same calculation rate making the school has more teachers than the capacity to recruit new ones. But there is a rate of teacher labor that exceeds in general subjects. The transfer of teachers also requires the same rules, criteria and procedures as other regular secondary schools. It resulted on schools being unable to select teachers with proper knowledge, abilities and skills they need in order to teach effectively in schools that organize new education. Although, the transferred teachers may already have knowledge and some understanding of the school working context but some teachers simply cannot adapt to the school culture. This causes stress, discouragement, and boredom, resulting in reduced ability to work and affect the students learning.

3) Recruiting from scholarship students - most of teachers were allocated from the scholarship recipients. They are qualified in terms of necessary knowledge, abilities, skills and other special attributes: modern; creativity; dedication; and attention to learners. However, there may be some difficulties in adjusting to living with others and sharing knowledge.

3.1.2 Problems

Five problems in teacher recruitment of schools in PCSHS were lack of decentralization recruiting policy; lack of school participation; lack of fairness; lack of planning; and other issues such as lack of motivation of benefits, stress from school culture adaptation, and injustice in recruiting. These problems can be clarified as follow.

1) The issue of decentralization, it was found that the operation through the use of the same teachers recruiting rules and methods as other regular schools causing delays of teachers' appointment process and resulting in the unqualified teachers. Teacher's qualifications or characteristics set and their lack of knowledge and understanding of the school culture and work system did not meet the needs of PCSHS.

2) The issue of participation, it was found that PCSHS did not have chances to participate in the selection of new teachers or teachers who request to transfer from other schools. As a result, the new teachers lacked specific knowledge, abilities and skills required by PCSHS. Besides, teachers who transferred from other schools were unable to teach or adapt to PCSHS's culture.

3) The issue of neutrality and fairness, it was found that the migration process caused unfairness from the patronage system and demanding money letting unqualified people into the system.

4) The issue of future planning, it was found that long-term manpower planning and the maintenance of good and smart people cannot be carried out in practice. According to the manpower plan laid down, teacher recruiting must still be based on centralized recruitment practices and traditional criteria and methods.

5) The issue of retention, it was found that the traditional recruitment and relocation process resulting in teachers who do not meet the needs. As a result, teachers lack motivation to perform tasks, inability to adapt to the school culture, and there is a high rate of relocation and resignation.

3.1.3 Needs

Five needs consisted of schools' independence in teachers recruiting; personnel's participation; committee consideration in teacher selection, decision-making and setting teachers' qualifications such as receiving above Master degree education or honors award; long-term planning; and teachers motivating.

3.1.4 Solutions to problems

The overall contextual approaches to problem solving are as follow.

1) Ask for help in developing teachers from networks such as best practice schools and local universities in order to help improve the qualifications and attributes of existing personnel to reach the school requirement.

2) Provide special remuneration allocation or other welfare or bonus for some performance items, such as compensation for teaching part-time in academic clinics or study abroad expenses and scholarship.

3) Procure the additional budgets for hiring qualified teachers and government employees.

4) Organize mentors to motivate qualified people to help the unqualified people or let them teach the lower level class.

5) Hire employees on a yearly contract basis by school committee recruiting process and provide the welfare such as meals, dormitory, and etc.

3.2 The result on factors contributing to the success of recruiting and retention

Factors contributing to the success of teacher recruitment and retention for the institutes conducting new education system were transparent policies in management, supervision, monitoring and decisions making in the form of committee; various appropriate and fair rules and procedures; good and clear school and administrative structure and system; and attractive monetary and non-monetary incentives.

3.2.1 Factors contributing to the success of teacher recruiting

The achievement of teacher recruitment process is based on four important factors. The first one is the working policy in the manner of school groups with fair standards and exchange of assistance between schools. The second one is the management criteria and methods that are diverse, correct, appropriate, and meet the needs. The third one is a clear management structure and system for more efficient targeting and manpower planning. The last one is the monetary incentives such as compensation allocation and the non-monetary such as readiness learners, personnel and colleagues, job challenges, school environment, budget, facilities, and welfare including internal and external networks.

3.2.2 Factors contributing to the success of teacher retention

Factors contributing the success of teachers' sustainable retention in PCSHS group are summarized into 2 categories: monetary and non-monetary motivation factors. This enhances the teachers productive and effective work performance and their satisfaction.

1) The monetary motivation factor included special compensation such as part-time special clinic tuition fees.

2) The non-monetary motivation factor consisted of various factors as follow.

2.1) The readiness-It includes the readiness of the school and administrators in management, assistance and promotion; readiness of good colleagues carrying cooperation, sacrifice, dedication, perseverance, love for unity and close friendship; readiness of learners who study hard with good knowledge, skills, and special abilities; availability of budgets, materials, tools, facilities, utilities and environments that enable teachers to transfer knowledge and skills to learners and to develop learners to their full potential; and availability of academic welfare in development opportunities. Besides, the staffs realize the success of school, self, colleagues, and students.

2.2) The distinctive qualifications and characteristics of teachers-Teaching staff not only have proper qualification such in knowledge, abilities and education level; but also carry ideology, sacrifice, determination, dedication, cooperation, love in the organization and career oriented manner. They were self-esteem, understanding, non-compulsion, appreciation, acceptance, forgiveness, adaptability,

107

and flexibility. Also, they have the ability to deal with problems by using communication and discussion.

2.3) Appropriateness of class arrangements-The determining numbers of students per class is 20.

2.4) The effective network-They receives the development support and academic assistance from strong networks both within and outside school groups.

3.3 The result on guidelines for teachers recruiting for the institutes conducting new teaching-learning system

The findings concluded with five key recruiting guidelines: decentralization; participation; transparency; future-oriented recruitment for teachers maintaining; and diversity-based recruitment. Besides, six teacher recruitment methods for specific school like PCSHS were proposed: the recruiting by exams; by scholarship; by school funding; by personnel transfer; by school personnel selection; and by school or committee nomination as follow.

3.3.1 Five key recruiting guidelines

The guidelines for recruiting teachers of educational institutions that provide new teaching and learning methods summarized five basic principles for recruiting in order to achieve success according to the goals of educational institutions that are set to be an international standard school. The first one is the principle of decentralization emphasizing the independence in recruiting teachers by the school group. Second is the principle of participation focusing on all parties involved in recruiting teachers; both within the school and the school group participated in the presentation, review, screening and decision making. Third is the principle of neutrality, transparency and fairness focusing on the nomination process by the established central committee among school group and the school committees authorizes them to determine qualifications of requiring teacher attributes including consideration and decision making. Fourth is the principle of forward-looking or future-oriented recruiting focusing on 1) advanced planning the long-term manpower within 5-10 years, and 2) determining the various recruiting pattern, criteria and methods. There were separate considerations, such as the main course teacher and the elective teacher. Fifth is the principle of recruiting for maintaining focusing on creating incentives to keep quality teachers recruited in the system as long as possible such as special compensation or funding for self-development.

3.3.2 Six teacher recruitment methods

Six teacher recruitment methods were proposed: recruiting by exams; recruiting by scholarship; recruiting by school funding; recruiting by personnel transfer; recruiting by school personnel selection; and recruiting by school or committee nomination.

4.   Discussion

4.1 The condition, problems, needs and solutions to problems of teacher recruitment

Freedom in teacher recruiting - The results of the study revealed that lack of decentralization and participation are the main problems in PCSHS teacher recruiting. PCSHS group needs freedom in recruiting teachers on their own. Thus, the

108

responsible agencies at the highest level, namely, the ministry level, should formulate policies in a descending order of decentralization in determining rules, regulations, criteria and methods for recruiting teachers. This is to response to the needs of the school to provide personnel with the knowledge, competence and skills to meet their own needs and be positioned in a timely manner as much as possible. It is consistent with Mankikar (2014) who prioritizes allocation of the right placement at the right time. School and stakeholder participation will help empowering problem solving and motivating as well as help fostering a sense of responsibility for more sustainable and efficient resource management. It is able to ensure fairness in recruiting and ensure that human resources are allocated sufficiently and appropriately to meet the school requirements which will benefit the organization. Mankikar (2014) also said that if people who are suitable for creating benefits to the organization are selected, organization will be safe and sustain.

Teachers' qualifications setting - The need in teachers' qualifications setting is also mentioned in this part of study result. The teachers receiving above Master Degree education (Ph.D. is preferable) or honors award are required. They were expected to be good at both specific knowledge and skill based on their educational background, especially their research skill and experience. This is in line with the study result of Japan's National Institute of Technology (NIT) best practices revealing five outstanding teacher qualifications, namely, skills and experiences; educational level (Ph.D.); educational background; academic and research publication; and self-reputation (attitude, vision, belief) (OTEPC, 2020).

4.2 Factors contributing to the success of recruiting and retention

Motivation factor - Motivation is the main factor contributing to the success of both teacher recruitment and retention. Both monetary and non-monetary motivations enhance the organization to be able to recruit the most suitable person into the schools. Another thing to keep in mind is what the school should do in order to maintain these personnel with the organization after recruiting the most suitable person sustainably. Therefore, the school must create incentives that can motivate the teacher to work hard by building morale and by allocating the monetary incentives, such as compensation or bonuses; and non-monetary incentives, such as self-development benefits, training. This is consistent with Anand et al. (2 0 1 8) has proposed. When the organization selects a personnel that match the job, provide good training and provide proper care for them, these personnel will not only create good results for the organization but also tends to remain in that organization for longer. In sum, well-suited and well-motivated individuals can create success for the organization work to achieve the goals of the school itself.

4.3 Guidelines for teachers recruiting for the institutes conducting new teaching-learning system

Five key recruiting principles – guidelines for PCSHS teachers recruiting included decentralization; participation; transparency; future-oriented recruitment for teachers maintaining; and diversity-based recruitment. The development of a teacher recruiting guideline is to precisely cater to the needs of schools. Therefore, teacher recruiting policies should be enhanced by altering existing structures or by adapting new and innovative policies to diffuse them. More power down to the action unit. According to

109

Bennett & Howlett's Theory of Institutional Change (Bennett & Howlett, 1992), this concept was developed for policy change that can be transferred from large to small units. This is in line with Streeck & Thelen (2005), which stated that changes in formal policy-making, rules and regulations would result in the delegation of powers of the organization to the lower level through means of communicating the needs and participation of the more lower-level. This will have a positive effect on the decision-making system that is faster and makes decisions more consistent or adaptable to local needs. Therefore, it reduces the problem of in teachers recruiting and appointing delays to meet the needs of schools. At the same time, this makes a good match of the recruited person with the needs of the school such in their knowledge, competence and skills, and attributes. It will also produce good results in the long run by helping to eliminate the barriers of laws, rules, and regulations. It helps enhance the capacity and strength of schools in order to innovate to solve new problems in order to truly respond to the needs by self-creating a sense of unity and meaningful participation. It also helps to eliminate any corruption that may occur through the authority.

Policy change should be implemented at five levels: ministry policy level; provincial policy level; district policy level; school group policy level; and 5) school policy level, in order to ensure consistency at all levels. Policy at the ministry level should focus on decentralization in recruiting teachers to the lowest level as much as possible. Then, ministry should consistent change the policy at the secondary level, namely, the provincial policy, district-level policy, school group policy, including school policy, respectively. The policy change must focus on opened opportunities for of the lower level agencies participation. They should let the subordinate departments to create their recruitment and manpower plans in both short term and long term. It is a plan that focuses on maintaining quality teachers in a sustainable system and proceeds according to the plan in the form of a committee to create fairness in the selection of teachers.

Fair recruiting is possible not only does it operate in a way that opens up opportunities for stakeholder participation but must also act in the manner of the committee. The committee is appointed through a participatory decision-making process and avoiding an influence of patronage system (Wongsarsri, 1995). This will provide the opportunity for qualified persons to receive a fair recruitment system. It is in line with Mankikar (2014) summarized that the selection process must ensure that it is an open process with fairness and transparency. Also it is in agreement with Rakkanngan (1989) who has given principles under the merit system that is generally accepted as a system that helps promote the efficiency of the organization's operations both in terms of management and performance. This will reduce existing payment or sponsorship problems causing personnel satisfaction. This is consistent with research result of Bhoganadam & Rao (2014) showing the level of personnel satisfaction with the ethical and transparent recruitment and selection process of the organization.

Besides, an effective form of recruiting must be in various methods which can create a high success for the school recruitment and maintenance process. The operation of both open and closed systems, for instance, will response to the success of the school's goals in the end as well as the recruiting from both outside and within

110

the school. This is consistent with Anand et al. (2018) who has pointed out that the most qualified candidates can come from internal and external recruiting. As same as Niglo (1959) stating that the benefits of open policy are those that allow individuals to have the knowledge, competence, experience, expertise and qualifications required by the organization to access to all positions and apply to work at all levels or all target groups with equality. At the same time, the benefits of recruiting people from within the organization will bring people who have experience and understanding of the organization's context which do not require much adjustment (McCullagh et al., 2014). This is in line with Ketkajornnan (1998) stating that recruiting people from within the organization with knowledge, skills and experience to work in a vacant position or a new position is to create morale for those who have worked with the organization for a long time and help save costs, save time in recruiting, training or motivating as well.

5.   Conclusion

The research conclusion and recommendation from this research is to emphasize the findings from the research so that the stakeholders can apply them properly. This has resulted in the recruitment of teachers who will acquire the knowledge, abilities, and skills as well as the qualities required by educational institutions in an efficient, transparent and fair manner. Most importantly, it will be able to respond to the achievement of school goals that can manage new teaching methods. The findings from the results of the research studies mentioned above include guideline for managing teacher recruitment and teacher recruitment model. It focuses on teacher recruiting operations in accordance with 5 main principles: decentralization; participation; fairness and transparency; future-oriented recruiting; and recruitment for maintaining. It emphasizes on participation from all sectors, variety of methods and determining appropriate educational qualifications, such as graduating with a master's degree or higher with special attention to those who have graduated with a Ph.D. and those who have received an education award or have an honors degree.

The policy recommendations recommend the Ministry's policy to decentralize powers. They may delegate powers and responsibilities to agencies at two subordinate levels. Level 1 is provincial and district level. It has the duty to promote; support and give suggestions about incentives to maintain teachers; solve and report problems; and supervise, monitor, and evaluate the results of teacher recruitment. Level 2 includes departments at the school group level and the educational institution level. It is responsible for determining regulations, rules and procedures for manpower planning, examining, screening and proposing needs, giving opinions, as well as nominating desired persons. Moreover, it should implement and consider recruiting and recruiting incentives as well as report problems and solutions including the results of operations.

The next research recommendation recommends further research studies and research studies in other processes related to the recruitment of teachers such as further research to study the effect of using the guidelines and teacher recruiting model in PCSHS group. Further research should also study the satisfaction of all stakeholders when applying the guidelines and model for recruiting teachers in

PCSHS group. A feasibility to apply the finding with other educational institutions should be conducted. Besides, the study of methods and patterns of the manpower rate planning system, compensation and welfare system, development system and maintenance system of educational institutions conducting specific teaching and learning system that respond to the success of educational institutions are also recommended.

References

Agarwal, B. (2001). Participatory Exclusions, Community Forestry, and Gender: *An Analysis for South Asia and a Conceptual Framework. World Development* 29, 1623-1648.

Anand, V. et al. (2018). A study on effectiveness of recruitment organizational support in ITeS. *International Journal of Pure and Applied Mathematics* 119 (7): 2755-2763.

Bennett, C. and Howlett, M. (1992). The lessons of learning: reconciling theories of policy learning and policy change. *Policy Sciences* 25: 275-294.

Bhoganadam, S. and Rao, D. (2014). A study on recruitment and selection process of Sai Global Rarntex (India) Private Limited. *International Journal of Management Research & Review* 4 (10): 996-1006.

Britannica. (2019). **Spoil system**. [Online]. Retrieved from https://www.britannica.com/topic/spoils-system. (October 24, 2019).

Cerna, L. (2013). **The Nature of policy change and implementation: A review of different theoretical approaches**. [Online]. Retrieved from https://www.oecd.org/education/ceri/The%20Nature%20of%20Policy%20Change%20and%20Implementation.pdf. (October 4, 2019).

Devas, N. and Grant, U. (2003). Local government decision-making – citizen participation and local accountability: some evidence from Kenya and Uganda. *Public Administration and Development* 23, 307-316.

Education Council. (2017). **National Education Plan 2017-2036**. Bangkok: Office of the Education Council Secretariat. [in Thai]

Hutchcroft, P. (2002). Centralization and decentralization in administration and politics: assessing territorial dimensions of authority and power. *Governance* 14 (1): 23 – 53.

Iyer, S. (2018). **What are the main components of a recruitment policy?.** [Online]. Retrieved from http://www.quora.com. (February 21, 2019).

Ketkajornnan, N. (1998). **Human Resources Management**. Bangkok: Printing House of Chulalongkorn University. (1998) [in Thai]

Mankikar, S. (2014). A critical study on recruitment and selection with reference to HR consulting firms. *Indian Journal of Research* 3 (3): 108-111.

Mathis, L. and Jackson, H. (2010). **Human resource management** (13th ed.). Cincinnati, OH: South-Western College.

Marume, S. and Jubenkanda, R. (2016). Centralization and decentralization. *Quest Journals Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Science* 4 (6): 106-110.

McCullagh, M., Sanon, M., and Cohen, M. (2014). Strategies to enhance participant recruitment and retention in research involving a community-based population. *Appl Nurs Res* 27 (4): 249-253.

Mok, H. (2004). **Centralization and decentralization: changing governance in education**. In: Ka-Ho M. (eds) Centralization and Decentralization. CERC Studies in Comparative Education, vol 13. Springer, Dordrecht.

Niglo, A. 1959. **Public Personnel Administration**. New York : Henry Holtand Company.

OTEPC. (2020). **Best practices and achievement factors in the recruitment system of the National Institute of Technology, Japan**. Bangkok, Ministry of Education.

Roja, D., Sainath, K., and Sai, K. (2018-2019). A study of recruitment and selection process at Balaji Dairy, Tirupati. *An International Journal of Advanced Studies* 3 (4): 1-9.

Streeck, W. and Thelen, K. (2005). **Introduction: institutional change in advanced political economies**, in W. Streeck and K. Thelen, Beyond Continuity: Institutional Change in Advanced Political Economies, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Surbhi, S. (2017). Difference between centralization and decentralization. [Online]. Retrieved from https://keydifferences.com/difference-between-centralization-and-decentralization.html. (April 9, 2020).

Susairaj, A. and Jenifer, A. (2018). A study on employee challenges towards recruitment and selection process. *International Journal of Business and Administration Research Review* 2 (21): 1-7.

The Free Dictionary by Farlex. (2019). **Spoils system**. [Online]. Retrieved from https://www.thefreedictionary.com/patronage+system. February 21, 2019

Wongsarsri, P. (1999). Human Resource Management. Suan Dusit Rajabhat University Book Center, Bangkok.