

Partnership Governance as A Base for Strengthening Regional Tourism

Muchamad Zaenuri¹, Atik Septi Winarsih

Lecturer of Government Affairs and Administration
Muhammadiyah University Yogyakarta, Indonesia

Abstract:

Strengthening tourism affairs for a region is not possible only by the government alone, the involvement of the private sector and the community in tourism is a necessity. Tourism is a system that integrates government, private and community; but the three pillars have not yet been able to form a partnership relationship. The relationship between the three seemed to be still based on a contractual relationship. Batu City as a city that has a popular tourist destination also faced with this problem. Some tourist objects and attractions (ODTW) and cultural events have been carried out through cooperation between the three pillars of tourism, but until now still encounter various obstacles that are generally not based on partnership.

Paper is downloading said the cooperation between the government and the private sector and the community at events travel "Stone Flower Festival" in Batu based on partnership. In this event developed the concept of a new partnership to be able to give a theoretical explanation of the phenomena associated with the implementation of regional tourism affairs. With the new concept of partnership, clarity is gained about the role of stakeholders, the policies developed by the government and the impacts on stakeholders. The developed partnership is equal and autonomous, sharing benefits and risks, pooling of resources, high intensity, and valid for a long period.

Basing on the problems it is in this paper has the objective another: 1) to an explanation of the role of stakeholders in the partnership, 2) to the explanation of the policy of partnership in Batu, and 3) explain the impact of the partnership for the government, private and social. By using qualitative research methods and using interview techniques, focus group discussions and observations, this study of tourism partnerships results in the finding that the roles of each stakeholder are in accordance with their capacities, policies taken by the Batu City Government have led to partnerships through sharing management and resources, and the impact of the partnership brings an increase in local own-source revenue and community income. Recommendations that can be submitted so that the Batu Flower Festival event can be continued and involve a wider community and more massive promotions.

Key words: Partnership Governance, Tourism, Local Government.

Introduction

This research is motivated by the existence of empirical problems in the administration of tourism affairs by the local government, especially in Batu City which requires reinforcement for the organization of tourism events. Research from Zaenuri (2015) shows that the administration of tourism affairs in the region cannot be effective if it is not supported by other *stakeholders* such as the private sector and the community. In organizing tourism affairs, Batu City also cooperates with various *stakeholders among* other private companies and community groups providing tourism products and services.

Even though tourism affairs for the region are not mandatory but are optional, in Kota Batu the contribution made to economic development is very significant. Tourism can provide a *multiplier effect* for the growth of other productive economic activities. Tourism can create new jobs and can overcome poverty (Damanik, 2005) and can provide welfare for people in the region (Damanik 2010).

Private and public involvement in tourism activities is a necessity, in general the government has limitations in providing *public good* and services, including in tourism activities. These limitations are stated by Dwiyanto (2012: 90) as follows:

“As public needs for public services increase and when the capacity of government bureaucracy is increasingly limited, the involvement of the private sector and the public in public services is a necessity. The dominance of government bureaucracy in various aspects of community life is doubtful. The strengthening of the flow of democratization raises the need to empower communities and stakeholders outside the government bureaucracy in the delivery of public services. Especially when service aspirations become higher, community involvement in the delivery of public services is no longer a necessity, but has become a necessity”.

The conditions related to government limitations in tourism affairs allow the role of the private sector to increase. Interaction between the government and the private sector allows for a short-term, win-win or long-term cooperation contract, likewise the interaction with the community will enable the existence of community empowerment programs around tourism objects that are increasingly diverse and applicable. Interaction and cooperation between the government and the private sector in good practice is referred to as *good governance*.

An effort to realize *good governance* in the field of tourism are certainly not easy because the three pillars of governance do not have the same and parallel capabilities and positions. As stated by Dwiyanto (2012) that cooperation between the government and the private sector / community has so far been limited to cooperation between the work owner and non-

governmental institutions as *vendors* or contractors. Such cooperation is nothing more than a sale and purchase transaction of goods and services between the government as the principal and the private sector or the community as an agent. Cooperation tends to be more short term with limited relationship intensity as stipulated in the clause in the contract.

The problems raised by Dwiyanto certainly lead to new thoughts to develop concepts that can solve these problems, the new concept in question is governance based on partnership (partnership) which in the public administration science by some experts is called the concept of *partnership governance* (Hall, 1999; Zadek & Redovich, 2006, Munro, 2008; Dwiyanto, 2012).

The application of the concept of *governance* in the administration of tourism affairs for local governments in Indonesia is already familiar. Batu City Government has practiced this concept in various objects and tourist attractions (ODTW) and also in organizing certain events, one of which is the " Batu Flower Festival " event. The management of this activity applies the concept of governance which is realized in the form of cooperation with the private sector which is formally institutionalized. Likewise, there are tourism activities carried out in collaboration with community groups, cultural and artistic events are prominent examples of tourism activities that directly involve community groups.

Interactions that have occurred between the government, the private sector and the community are still contractual in nature and there is no sharing of risks. Most of the activities of the Tourism Department are not yet a partnership. Batu City Government as a principal will look for partners to work on programs or activities and partners as agents who will carry out the work or program. Batu City Government as the owner of the work and partners or nongovernmental institutions as *vendors* or contractors. Some development in Batu mostly done by using a pattern like that, so that more cooperation is transactional purchase.

The issue of partnership in tourism management also occurs in the Greater Malang area where Batu City is part of it. Study from Rachayuningsih (2010) shows that the partnership between *stakeholders* consisting of the local government of the tourism industry and the tourism community still has not occurred high synergy. Partnership that exists as a late were still dominated by the government.

From this background it is necessary to formulate the problem include: How can the role of government, private sector and communities in the implementation of " Stone Flower Festival "? What are the policies taken by the Batu City Government in partnership? How do impact partnership for stakeholders?

Theoretical Framework

1. Partnership Governance in Tourism

The implementation of the concept of governance in the tourism sector involving the government and the private sector manifested in the form of *public-private partnership* (*public-private partnership*) has actually been going on for quite a long time. According to notes from Ray Pine (2002) as quoted by Nuryanti (2002: 12) some practices of public-private cooperation in the field of tourism include:

- a) In Australia there is an "ATC Partnership Australia" program which aims to pool resources and avoid duplication of effort. Besides that there is also the *Tourism Forecasting Council and the Co-operation Research Center for Sustainable Tourism*, this is a consortium consisting of 14 privately owned universities, the federal government and the government. The concept in this consortium is to internationalize and open up opportunities for academic and government institutions to be involved in tourism activities in APEC member regions.
- b) In Canada, the Canadian NTA restructured in 1995 resulted in the establishment of the *Canadian Tourism Commission*, a form of partnership between the state and central government and the public sector. These results have been able to increase tourism revenues in 1995 by 15 million dollars to 136.8 million dollars in 1998 and 1999.
- c) At the local level of California America, a rule, the *California Tourism Marketing Act*, was used to establish the *California Travel and Tourism Commission*. This commission is a *public-private* partnership between the California government and companies related to the tourism industry. In the partnership the private company contributed US \$ 7.3 million which was used to improve the information system and tourist facilities as well as to increase the tourism marketing business.
- d) In Thailand, in 1995 the Thai tourism organization TAT had collaborated with the private sector in the form of informal partnerships. This partnership has been noted as providing support for the success of the "Amazing Thailand" tourism campaign. This success was due to the involvement of industry associations such as the *Association of Thai Travel Agents*, the *Thai Hotel Association* and the *Thai Incentive and Conventions Association* under the *Thailand Tourism Society*.

The concept of governance in tourism has led to the realization of partnerships between the government and the private sector and has been proven to bring practical improvements in tourism management. While the practice of cooperation between the government and the

community in organizing tourism affairs has also been going on for quite a long time. Several studies have been carried out among others:

- a) The study of Bill Bramwell (2006), research on partnerships and regional tourism development in Brazil, from this study found that tourism development through partnerships can be more efficient and have a high carrying capacity from the community.
- b) Studies from Rachayunings i (2010) in Malang Raya show that the partnership efforts undertaken by the government and the community in organizing tourism events are quite effective, community participation is high enough to succeed the cultural events that take place with the theme "Malang Tempo Doeloe".
- c) Research conducted in North Cyprus by Alipour et al (2011) after it was published in the Journal of Sustainable Development with the title "Governance as a Catalyst for Sustainable Tourism Development: Evidence from North Cyprus" yields the conclusion that sustainable tourism planning cannot be carried out effectively if the institution not restructuring organizational behaviour in the form of a formal policy process to enhance close collaboration with stakeholders (the tourism industry and the community).
- d) Research from Zapata and Hall (2012) conducted in Spain discusses the balance between effectiveness and legitimacy in partnerships between government and private sector. In this study, it was found that cooperation that has high legitimacy is more effective in its implementation.

From the concept and practice of organizing tourism affairs, collaboration between the government and the private sector and the community shows a necessity. The collaboration that has already taken place does not necessarily lead to partnerships, strengthening tourism activities based on partnerships will of course last for quite a long period of time with high intensity, not based on contractual relations, being equal and autonomous, sharing risks, and the pooling of resources.

2. The Concept of Partnership Governance

The basic concept of *governance* is the interaction or collaboration between the government, the private sector and the community in conducting government affairs based on the principles of good governance. An understanding of *governance* cannot be separated from the role of the three pillars in managing affairs in the public sector so that these functions are more effective and efficient. The further development of *governance* gave birth to the concept of a more emphasis on the relationships that are characterized by particular so as to provide a new label to the concept of *governance*, among others *partnership governance*, the pattern of

relationship between the government, private and public held government affairs by relying on principles partnership.

Bovaird (2004) defines partnership as a work arrangement based on mutual commitment, exceeding and above those stipulated in each contract, between one organization in the public sector and organizations outside the public sector. Likewise, Munro (2008) sees *partnership* as a form of collaboration between community leaders and public managers for the effectiveness of democracy.

Most of the government actually has cooperated with various parties, but most of the cooperation that was built is still conventional (non-partnership), which is limited to cooperation between the government as the owner of work with private institutions as *vendors* or contractors. This cooperation is nothing more than a sale and purchase transaction of goods and services between the government as the principal and the private party as an agent. The position between the two is not equal, the government as the principal has the authority to choose an agent in accordance with its criteria to carry out the work. Cooperation tends to be short-term with limited relationship intensity, as stipulated in the contract. Benefits from cooperation are counted as compensation or achievements and risks borne by each party. The collaboration that was built did not involve resources from the agency, there was no pooling of resources. When viewed from the pattern of cooperation it seems that there is already a partnership between the government and non-government, but actually there is not yet (Dwiyanto, 2012: 251).

Partnership -based cooperation, between the government and the private sector and the community, each party seeks to engage in alliances, unifying vision, unifying goals, strategies and activities in order to achieve common goals. Nevertheless, each still has the authority to make decisions independently. Relationships that are built with the community are of a partnership nature, the agent's principal relationship does not apply because the cooperation that occurs is the collaboration between the principal and the principal. Partnering partners are principals and at the same time act as agents for themselves. Partnership involves both parties to share resources, risks, responsibilities and benefits. The nature of this cooperation makes the partnership oriented to long-term interests because it requires endurance and high enough interaction from both parties (Dwiyanto, 2012: 256). The differences can be seen in the following table:

Table 1. Differences in Partnership and Non-Partnership Collaboration

Characteristic features	Types of Public and Private / Community Cooperation	
	Partnership	Non-partnership
The nature of cooperation	Collaborative	Privatization, <i>Outsourcing</i>
Intensity	High	Low
Period of time	Long	Short
Position of the parties	Equivalent and autonomous	Not equivalent and bound by contract
Benefits and risks	Share the benefits and risks	Benefits are calculated as compensation for performance, and the risk is borne by each party
Resources for the implementation of activities	Merging resources	There is no pooling of resources

Source: Dwiyanto, 2012: 256

In the partnership relationship mentioned above, each party has a specific role and will benefit together, namely:

- a) In the partnership relationship between the government and the private sector, the government can play a role in formulating policies and rules and providing licensing services, and developing cooperation between regions that enables tourism industry players to develop mutual investment. While from the private sector, the partnership will stimulate the role of the private sector to make investments because it has obtained a conducive climate for the role of the government in providing clarity of regulations and permits.
- b) In a partnership relationship between the government and the community (community), the government has developed policies that favour the public that are transparent and accountable. This can provide an opportunity for the community to participate in obtaining employment opportunities and to try within the framework of equality and justice.

In accordance with the concept put forward that to explain the phenomenon of partnership in tourism can be used an approach of the role of stakeholders and policies that have been taken by the government. Likewise, in order to know the benefits of partnerships for stakeholders, it can be investigated how the impacts arising from the partnership activities. This paper explains these three things in the Batu Flower Festival case in Batu City.

Research Method

To find out the strengthening of partnership-based tourism, qualitative research methods are needed using descriptive techniques. The choice of research location is in accordance with the topic in the form of organizing a partnership-based tourism event using interview, documentation and observation techniques at the research location. Data analysis was carried out by identifying the role of the solder that was then sought by the degree of closeness to show the partnership pattern that had existed.

Result and Analysis

1. General description of Batu Flower Festival event activities

The Batu Flower Festival event or also called the Flower Car Parade in Batu City has been held routinely every year which usually coincides with the RI Anniversary and the Anniversary of Batu City. This activity was held with the aim of moving the economy of the City of Batu through a monumental event, providing a means of creativity to artists and flower craftsmen in the City of Batu, providing interesting and quality entertainment to the public and tourists visiting the City of Batu as well as a means of tourism promotion in the City of Batu .

This activity was coordinated by the Batu City Tourism and Culture Office in collaboration with the Batu City PHRI and the Decorative Flower Farmers Association (Gapoktan) in Batu City, which was participated by all Regional Apparatus Organizations (OPD), Villages and Villages as well as government and private agencies in Batu City.

The form of activities is a decorative car parade with the following conditions:

- a) Participants of the Batu Flower Festival are decorative cars with floral materials such as decorative flowers, garden flowers, cut flowers or dried flowers or those made of paper, cloth, stereofomes or other similar material.
- b) The shape of the decorative car is adjusted to each theme, preferably leading to technology and aesthetics.
- c) If there is a companion who walks as a companion for an ornamental car, the costume used must be made and flowers or other materials made such as flowers.
- d) Decorative pedestrians and escorts of a maximum of 30 (thirty) people.
- e) Participants representing their respective institutions do not represent the Village.
- f) Speeches or attractions are only allowed in the area designated by the committee with the duration of each speech or attraction for 5 to 10 minutes.

- g) Participants must maintain the safety of their respective ornamental cars both at start, on the go and at the finish.

To motivate each participant to display their creations to the fullest, the committee provides an assessment and award by determining the 10 (ten) participants with the best performance, with rating criteria, namely the suitability of the theme to the appearance, creativity, especially related to technology, beauty, order, neatness and overall appearance.

2. Partnership policy in the " Batu Flower Festival " event

The policies that underlie the implementation of the Batu Flower Festival event are the Mayor's Decree and the Decree of the Head of the Tourism and Culture Office of Batu City. The composition of the committee involved various elements ranging and elements of the City Government of Batu which involved several Regional Apparatus Organizations (OPD), elements of community organizations such as KNPI, private elements such as PHRI and elements of society namely culture, cottage art and a combination of ornamental farmer groups. The composition of the committee for ornamental flower festival activities is regulated in the Decree of the Head of Batu City Tourism Office Number: 814/768 / 422.207 / 201 7.

If we look at the policy of the Batu City Government in managing the Batu Flower Festival events as mentioned above, the involvement of various elements ranging and elements of the City Government, in this case the Batu City Tourism and Culture Office, the private sector consisting of the PHRI and Jatim Park management, as well as the involvement of community elements consists of ornamental flower plant farmers or a group of ornamental flower farmer groups (Gapoktan) in Batu City. Although each year the composition of the committee changes, the involvement of the three elements, namely the government, the private sector and the community, always appears in the involvement of the management of the Stone Flower Festival.

3. Partnership initiative in the Batu Flower Festival event

The initial initiative for the partnership between the City Government of Batu, the private sector and the community in managing the Batu Flower Festival activities is the government party, in this case the Batu City Tourism and Culture Office. This is because this event is included in the work programs and activities that have been listed in the Batu City Regional Budget every year and are included in the East Java Province Tourism calendar.

The initial initiative originated from the Government was also strengthened by the Decree of the Mayor of Batu and the Decree of the Head of Tourism and Culture of the City of

Batu which consisted and the composition of the organizing committee of the Batu Flower Festival which consisted of government elements, private elements and community elements and the duties and division of their respective roles. the party.

4. Partnership needs in the Batu Flower Festival event

In seeing the needs, reasons or factors of externalities for these actors or actors to collaborate or collaborate with other parties in the Batu Flower Festival activities are as follows:

- a) For private parties this activity is used as a promotional tool for tourist visits to hotels and other tourist attractions. Commodities that can be sold so far for tourists to visit Batu City are natural beauty and cool air, if tourists are also treated to a variety of interesting events that can be displayed in Batu City, it is hoped that they will be a special support for tourists to visit Batu City, other than because natural beauty factor.
- b) For the community, especially the ornamental flower farmer groups, this event is a means to sell their merchandise or commodities so that this event can be a separate market segment for farmers. If this activity has been scheduled every year with the time that has also been set, then for ornamental flower farmers can prepare and plan in such a way that when needed not to run out of stock of flowers that must take and flower farmers and old Batu City.
- c) For Batu City Government, the perceived impact is to increase Local Revenue and some sectors, such as parking fees, advertisement tax and more macro, it is hoped that this event will increase community income and economic growth.

5. Actors and parties involved in the Batu Flower Festival event activities

The actors or actors involved in the Batu Flower Festival event are the Batu City Government, in this case the Batu City Tourism and Culture Office, the private sector, namely the PHRI of Batu City and the community of ornamental flower farmer associations incorporated in the Farmers Group Association (Gapoktan) flowers ornamental in the City of Stone with each different role division.

The City Government of Batu plays the role of organizer and Gapoktan acts as a provider of decorative flowers while PHRI plays a role in the promotion of tourism whose main activity is to introduce events to hotel guests visiting Batu City, the role is seen as in the following table:

Table 2. Actors and Roles in the Batu Flower Festival event

No	Party	Culprit	Role
1	Government	Batu City Tourism and Culture Office	Implementation and funding coordinator.
2	Public	Association of Farmers Group (Gapoktan) ornamental flowers Batu	Flower providers and festival performers
3	Private	PHRI Kota Batu, Jatim Park	Promote activities and provide lodging.

6. Impact of partnership

The partnership between the Batu City Government, the private sector and the community in managing the Batu Flower Festival event has had both positive and negative impacts. The following outlines the impacts on Batu City Government, impacts on the private sector and impacts on Kota Batu communities.

6.1. Impact of partnership on Batu City Government

When the Batu City government has established the vision of Batu City as a tourism centre, the consequence is that it must be vigorous in promoting the potential of Batu City to the outside world. This task cannot be carried out by the Batu City government itself due to the limitations of its financial sub-resources and other resources, without involving other parties, namely the private sector and the community.

One of the activities aimed at increasing tourism promotion is the Batu Flower Festival event, which is coordinated by the Batu City Government through the Tourism and Culture Office. In its implementation the Tourism and Culture Office of Batu City did not carry out these activities independently, but cooperated with the private sector, in this case the PHRI and the community, namely the Combined Decorative Flower Farmer Group in Batu City.

Determination of the time of the implementation of the Batu Flower Festival event on the recommendation and the PHRI on the grounds if the implementation is set at the weekend it will attract tourists to visit Batu City considering the Batu Flower Festival has been included in the main event on the East Java Province Tourism calendar. In addition to this event included in the East Java Province tourism calendar the PHRI and hotel and restaurant owners also promoted this activity through the distribution of leaflets in collaboration with the tour and

travel agents, as conveyed by Ms. Setyawati from the Department of Tourism and Culture of Batu City:

"To promote the Batu Flower Festival event, we collaborate with PHRI and travel tours as well as Jatim Park by distributing leaflets to these travels as well as to hotels and even the East Java Park moves themselves through their own access. The hotel and travel bureau network determines the dissemination of this tourism event "(Interview at the Office of Tourism, 18 May 2018)

The impact of the partnership in managing the Batu Flower Festival obtained for the Batu City Government is the task of promoting Batu City to become lighter, assisted by the private sector. Likewise, in the context of increasing the income of the community it was helped by the holding of the event.

6.2. The impact of partnerships on the private sector

Event Batu Flower Festival has a significant impact on tourist visits to Batu, especially for guests who stay at hotels. As stated by one of the hotel owners in Batu, the following:

" Stone Flower Festival enters an impact on a significant increase for guests staying at our hotel. Even though there are quite a lot of visitors to this event, the average community and Batu region don't have to stay overnight at the hotel, but it is also interesting for visitors from outside the city because they have been promoted well in advance. In the future, it will be improved for participants from outside the area, so that the echo will be wider, so that it will have an impact on increasing the number of guests staying at hotels" (Interview, May 19, 2018)

Besides recognition from hotel owners, an increase in the number of tourist visits is also felt by innkeepers or hotels that are not starred, as stated by the following lodging owners:

With this event I am certainly very happy because the lodging that I own has sold and there is a significant increase in tourists. From the notes I obtained from the guest book, it can be seen that the surge in visitors reached 50%. This increase has never happened in ordinary times. (Interview, May 20, 2018).

The impact of the partnership in the form of organizing events turned out to be able to increase the number of tourists, not only in star hotels but also in lodging. From interviews with several other tour operators also showed the same conditions, the travel agency also showed an increase of 40%.

6.3. Impact of partnership on the community

As a sample of the implementation of the Stone Flower Festival which was attended by approximately 80 (eighty) participants with the following details:

- a) Element of Village and Village as many as 24 ornamental cars
- b) Combined elements of hotel and tourist entrepreneurs as many as 7 ornamental cars
- c) Combined elements of farmer groups of 3 ornamental cars
- d) School elements are 25 ornamental cars
- e) The elements of the Regional Apparatus Organization (O PD) are 15 cars

Premises n assumption of costs for the procurement of 1 (one) unit of the float approximately US \$ 5 million to \$ 7 million and the revenue can be generated and the event Stone Flower Festival for growers of ornamental flowers will be very encouraging considering all the flowers used in this parade come from farmers in Batu City area, therefore this event is really awaited for ornamental flower farmers, as stated by one of the Gapoktan members of ornamental flowers, namely chrysanthemum flowers, as follows:

My income is gross every day between Rp. 200,000.00 (two thousand million rupiah) to Rp. 500,000.00 (five hundred thousand rupiah). But if there is a flower carnival like this it can be up to Rp. 1 .000.000,00 (one million rupiah). (Interview, 21 May 2018).

A similar sentiment was also conveyed by one of the participants of the decorative car parade to the village of Mojorejo, as follows:

There are three decorated cars that a right we show in the Stone Flower Festival. Each car will be decorated with about 1.5 million flowers, and various types. Three decorative cars Will be displayed, among others, themed classic cars, temples and pagodas in accordance with the eternal potential of Mojorejo and Tourism Park. One ornamental car minimum spend as much as Rp. 4 million. The flowers will be used to decorate the taken car and Batu City products themselves. (Interview, 21 May 2018).

In addition to having a positive impact on ornamental flower farmers, especially on increasing income, this event also provides many benefits for traveling food and beverage traders because so many visitors who watch this decorative car parade make itinerant food and beverage vendors selling their wares around the location and route of the event This also experienced an increase in income, as conveyed by Mr. Shaleh, the meatball seller from Pendem Village below:

On a normal day I annihilate the right of beef approximately 1,5 kg and income between Rp. 1,250,000. up to Rp. 1,500,000. but if there is a flower carnival like this it can cost up to 3 kg of beef and my gross income can reach Rp. 2,500,000 up to Rp. 3,600,000. Because of this, the government often holds activities like this. (Interview, 21 May 2018).

Every Batu Flower Festival event can be ascertained that all the streets that are passed by this decorative car parade route will surely experience traffic jams as conveyed by the Batu City Police Officers as follows:

This afternoon Batu Tourism City will be jammed because the city center lane will be closed completely starting at 10:00 WIB associated with the implementation of the annual flower festival so the implementation of this activity uses the city center lane. The road that is crossed is Sultan Agung Street, Agus Salim, Gajah Mada and Panglima Sudirman. This is the middle lane, although later the road will creep up, I estimate it will not be a total traffic jam, with the condition that the community meets the police's recommendations. (Interview, 21 May 2018).

Facing road congestion on motorbike or motorcycle taxi services is much in demand by visitors because it is more flexible to road congestion so that many motorcycle taxi drivers in Batu City also feel an increase in income due to the Batu Flower Festival event, as conveyed by Mr. Ardi, a resident of Tiekung Village who works everyday motorcycle taxi drivers:

On an average day my gross income is between Rp 100,000. up to Rp. 150 .000. before cutting the gasoline is less than 1.5 liters or around Rp. 12 .000. But if you're no crowds like these roads so jammed I get income Rp. 250,000 to Rp. 30,000. (Interview, May 22, 2018).

For the public, such as Mr. Ardi as a motorcycle taxi driver or Mr Sabar as a meatball trader, the actual event was not the Batu Flower Festival event but the crowd's element. With the crowd many visitors come and buy their wares. So what is expected for small communities like them is events or activities that bring a crowd that is often held in Batu City. E vent Stone Flower Festival much impact positive for society, especially in the income increasing, they are mainly growers of ornamental flowers, food and beverage vendor's circumference and motorcycle transportation services.

From these findings it can be analyzed that the roles of each stakeholder are proportional. The government plays a role in planning and providing facilities related to the

festival, the private sector promotes widely and the community through farmer groups provides flowers to be decorated. In accordance with the limitations of the partnership proposed by several experts, the Stone Flower Festival has been carried out in partnership and all parties have shared benefits, resources and management. This shows that the partnership has reached a comprehensive and autonomous partnership, each party can carry out its role independently for the wider interests.

Even though the partnership has been tightly and comprehensively established, its sustainability is still unclear. By looking at the success of the implementation of the Stone Flower Festival which is now of course continued for years to come. This is because all parties feel that they are benefited and increase the local revenue. The implementation of tourism affairs by the Batu City Government was helped by the Batu Flower Festival.

Conclusion & Recommendation

Based on the findings and analysis it can be concluded that the stakeholders involved in the partnership provide a very decisive role, the roles are synergistic with each other and can achieve the goals set. The policy taken by the City Government of Batu is very appropriate by giving freedom to the private sector and the community to be involved in tourism events. Batu Flower Festival tourism event activities have a positive impact on the government, the private sector and the community, especially the people increasing their income. Recommendations that can be given to the Batu City government are that this tourism agenda must be continued and improved in quality in a sustainable manner, for the private sector to be more aggressive in conducting promotions, and for the community to be more creative in displaying attractions.

References

- Alipour, Habib, Ruchan Kayaman Vaziri and Elena Ligay, 2011, "Governance as Catalyst to Sustainable Tourism Development: Evidence from North Cyprus", *Journal of Sustainable Development*, Vol. 4, No. 5.
- Bevir, Mark, 2011, *The Sage Handbook of Governance*, Los Angeles: SAGE.
- Bovaird, T, 2004. "Public Private Partnership from Contested Concept to Prevalent Practice", *International Review of Administrative Science*, 70 (2): 199-215.
- Bramwell, B. 2006. "Actors, Power and Discourses of Growth Limits", *Annals of Tourism Research* 33(4):957-978.

- Clayton, A., 1994, "Governance, Civil Society and the New World Order", in Clayton, A. (eds), *Governance, Democracy and Conditionality – Whot Role for NGO's ?*, Oxford: INTRAC.
- Damanik, Janianton, 2005, "Kebijakan Publik Dan Praksis Democratic Governance di Sektor Pariwisata", *Jurnal Sosial Politik*, UGM, Yogyakarta.
- Damanik, Janianton, 2010, "Merancang Format Baru Pariwisata Yang Menyejahterakan Rakyat", *Pidato Pengukuhan Jabatan Guru Besar* pada Fisipol UGM, Yogyakarta.
- Denhardt, Robert B and Janet V Denhardt. 2007. *The New Public Service, Serving, Not Steering*, Expanded Edition, New York: M.E.Sharpe.
- Dwiyanto, Agus, 2004. "Reorientasi Ilmu Administrasi Publik: Dari Government Ke Governance", *Pidato Pengukuhan Jabatan Guru Besar*, Yogyakarta: Fisipol UGM.
- Dwiyanto, Agus, 2012. *Manajemen Pelayanan Publik: Peduli, Inklusif, dan Kolaboratif*, Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.
- Frederickson, H. George, 2003, *Administrasi Negara Baru*, Terjemahan, Jakarta: LP3ES.
- Frederickson, H. George, et. all. 2012, *The Public Administration Theory Primer*, Second Edition, Colorado: Westview Press.
- Hall, C. Michael, 1999, "Rethinking Collaboration and Partnership: A Public Policy Perspective", *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, Vol 7 No. 3 & 4.
- Henry, Nicholash, 1986, *Administrasi Negara dan Masalah-masalah Kenegaraan*, Terjemahan, Jakarta: Rajawali Press.
- Kjaer, A.M., 2004, *Governance*, Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Kooiman, Jan, ed, 1993. *Modern Governance: New Government-Society Interactions*. London: SAGE Publications.
- Kuhn, Thomas S, 2008, *Peran Paradigma Dalam Revolusi Sains*, Terjemahan, Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Levy, Brian, 2007, *Governance Reform: Bridging, Monitoring and Action*, Washington DC: World Bank.
- Munro, H.A.D., Roberts, M., & Skelcher, C., 2008. "Partnership Governance and Democratic Effectiveness: Community Leaders and Public Managers as Dual Intermediaries", *Public Policy and Administration*, 23(1):61-79.
- Nisjar S, Karhi, 1997. "Beberapa Catatan Tentang Good Governance", *Jurnal Administrasi dan Pembangunan* 2, h.119.
- Nuryanti, Wiendu and Hwang W.G, 2002, *Private and Public Sector Partnership in Tourism Development*, Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.
- Odugbemi, Sina and Thomas Jacobson (eds), 2008, *Governance Reform Under Real World Conditions, Citizens, Stakeholders and Voice*, Washington DC: World Bank.

- Osborne, Stephen P., 2010. *The New Public Governance? Emerging perspectives on the theory and practice of public governance*. London: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group.
- Pemerintah Provinsi Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta, Peraturan Daerah Nomor 1 Tahun 2012 Tentang Rencana Induk Pembangunan Kepariwisata Daerah (Riparda)
- Peters, G. Guy and John Pierre, 1998, "Governance Without Government, Rethinking Public Administration", *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory* 8: 223-244.
- Pierre, Jon, and B. Guy Peters, 2000. *Governance, Politics and the State*. London: MacMillan Press Ltd.
- Pitana, I Gde dan Putu G. Gayatri, 2005, *Sosiologi Pariwisata*, Yogyakarta: Andi Offset.
- Rachayuningsih, Eny, 2010, Kebijakan Kemitraan Publik, Privat Dan Masyarakat Dalam Pengembangan Pariwisata, Studi Tentang Kebijakan Kemitraan Dalam Pengembangan Pariwisata di Malang Raya, *Disertasi*, FIA Universitas Brawijaya, Malang: Tidak Diterbitkan.
- Savas, E.S., 2000, *Privatization and Public-Private Partnership*, New Jersey: Catham House Publisher.
- Suwena, I Ketut dan I Gustu Ngurah Widayatmaja, 2010, *Ilmu Pariwisata*, Denpasar: Udayana University Press.
- Zadek, Simon and Sasha Radovich, 2006, "Governing Collaborative Governance, Enhancing Development Outcomes by Improving Partnership Governance and Accountability", *A Working Paper of the: Corporate Social Responsibility Initiative*, No. 23, April.
- Zaenuri, Muchamad, Sumartono, Soesilo Zauhar and Andy Fefta Wijaya, 2015, "Tourism Affair Management with Collaborative Governance Approach, Tourism Affairs Management Studies in Sleman Regency, Yogyakarta", *International Journal of Management and Administrative Sciences*, Vol 2, No. 06, p. 01-14.
- Zapata, Maria Jose and C. Michael Hall, 2012, "Public-private collaboration in the tourism sector: balancing legitimacy and effectiveness in local tourism partnerships. The Spanish case", *Journal of Policy Research in Tourism, Leisure and Events*, Vol. 4, No. 1.p.61-83.